

IMPACT OF NEW MINIMUM WAGE ON PRODUCTIVITY AMONG CIVIL SERVANTS IN ILORIN METROPOLIS, KWARA STATE, NIGERIA

EHINDERO, Elizabeth Ronke
07038746113/ronkeehindero@gmail.com
Al-Hikmah University, Ilorin, Nigeria

Abstract

The influence of incentives on efficiency within any organization, whether public or private, cannot be understated. The term "minimum wage" refers to the lowest amount of compensation an employee can receive for their work in a given month and is subject to periodic reassessment based on a country's economic situation. However, numerous empirical studies have shown that substantial wages and salaries serve as powerful motivators for enhanced performance among employees. Therefore, this investigation was inspired by the effects of Kwara State's newly enacted minimum wage on overall productivity amongst government agency personnel in Ilorin metropolis. Utilizing a descriptive survey approach, 240 participants from three ministries and three parastatals were involved – including both senior and junior staff members. The researcher employed structured questionnaires to gather relevant data from respondents using both descriptive and inferential statistical analyses to evaluate the collected information. The study's results indicated that the new minimum wage has encouraged workers to arrive promptly at their duties' location while leaving only after finishing their assigned tasks efficiently using appropriate technologies such as computers; furthermore, they collaborate effectively with colleagues when necessary. Consequently, various recommendations were suggested: regular payment schedules should be maintained by governmental authorities; remuneration should reflect current economic realities within society; other factors leading to high productivity among employees like loan facilities, conducive working environments with state-of-the-art technology provision are also essential considerations that warrant further attention in future policymaking efforts aiming towards effective management practices within public institutions involving human resources management strategies aimed at boosting workforce morale through improved compensation packages reflective of market trends while leveraging additional benefits such as training programs designed specifically around skill development needs identified by individual workers themselves - all aimed at fostering greater job satisfaction levels which contribute significantly towards higher levels of overall organizational success over time!

Keywords: Impact, Productivity, Minimum Wage, and Employee

Introduction

Since the inception of minimum wage in Nigeria's civil service, its impact on the economy has been a topic of intense debate. However, less attention has been given to the consequential effects on employees' productivity. This study seeks to investigate the influence of the recently implemented thirty-thousand naira minimum wage on workers' efficiency within Ilorin metropolis - Kwara State's capital city - as a case study. A nation's development is contingent upon both quality and quantity of goods and services provided by its human capital, including civil servants. It is documented that governmental institutions are staffed with civil servants from various cadres who receive monthly remunerations in terms of wages and salaries

based on agreed-upon terms of service. These individuals are referred to as pensioners or retirees after their active duty service period at local, state, or federal levels as civil servants comes to an end.

However, the compensation (i.e. salaries and wages) provided to civil servants on a monthly basis is subject to upward revision in response to economic realities within the country. Recently in Nigeria, labor unions such as the Nigerian Labour Congress (NLC) and Trade Union Congress (TUC), representing organized labor, advocated for an increase in civil servant take-home pay from its previous minimum wage of #18,000 to #30,000 across the nation. Negotiations for salary increases have taken on a tripartite agreement format involving representatives from organized labor, government officials and the Ministry of Labor headed by either the Minister of Labor or their delegate/representative. Performance or productivity measurement has become paramount among stakeholders within civil service management as it allows them to address three fundamental yet interrelated questions: How much was accomplished? How well was it done? Did people benefit as a result? These inquiries can be resolved through four types of performance measurement: process measures; output measures; service quality measures; and outcome measures (Pan et al, 2022).

Concept of Civil Service

Conceptualizing the term civil service can be a daunting task that requires scholarly effort. Section 318 of the 1999 Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria (FGN) provides a leading proposition for what the civil service of the federation ought to be. According to this constitution, civil service is defined as serving the federation in a civil capacity as an employee or staff member of either the office of the President, Vice President, Ministry or Department of government who may be assigned responsibilities for any business pertaining to the federation. This definition appears to center more on the structure and organization rather than on its responsibility coverage. Civil service may therefore be regarded as an institution within government run by men and women employed in a civilian capacity to carry out specific governmental responsibilities while enjoying security and tenure until retirement time.

According to the Wikipedia Online Free Encyclopedia (2021), civil service refers to a government sector primarily composed of career individuals, or civil servants, who are hired based on professional competence rather than being appointed or elected. Their institutional tenure typically survives transitions of political leadership. Civil servants work for federal, state and local governments and are answerable to the government rather than a political party. They are also known as public servants and serve in various departments or agencies responsible for public undertakings. Merriam-Webster Dictionary (2022) suggested other names such as following synonyms for civil service; bureaucrat, functionary, mandarin, and public servant.

Agbodike et al. (2015) opined that the civil service assumes the status of an engine room for modern society in any given country. The authors maintained further that it comprises an assemblage of career officials recruited in a civil capacity to serve their citizenry at prescribed work hours per day while equipped with training necessary to champion development processes by faithfully implementing government policies and programs transparently and accountably within their country's borders. However, Nigeria's adoption of Britain's model has failed its people judging from dysfunctions within Nigeria's polity upon which its civil service rests (Agbodike et al., 2015).

The civil service, as a part of the public sector, can be viewed as a process that involves a group of employees responsible for planning and organizing government operations. They provide professional advice and directly participate in implementing policies and programs of government ministries, departments or parastatals. These employees are commonly known as civil servants. However, it is important to note that ministers or commissioners head these ministries and departments where civil servants work, with assistance from permanent secretaries (directors general) and other departmental heads. According to Ameen et al (2016), the civil service refers to the state department tasked with implementing government policies and programs for which they receive salaries paid by taxpayers. The personnel in this arm of government perform purely administrative duties.

It can be inferred from the above discussion that the primary purpose of civil service is to achieve governmental goals effectively. In order for this objective to be attained optimally at minimal cost while maintaining high standards such as knowledge ability, incorruptibility among others; well-trained individuals equipped with requisite skills should comprise state's Civil Service workforce. Furthermore, it is imperative that there exist some core values such as freedom of speech, liberty among others which are intrinsic components within democratic systems; these features present an ideal environment conducive enough for effective performance towards realizing objectives set forth by Civil Service goals (Agbodike et al., 2015).

Overview of Kwara State Civil Service

There is ample evidence of changes in the Kwara State civil service throughout past administrations under the supervision of the Kwara State Civil Service Commission. Unfortunately, these changes have had little to no impact on workers' productivity due to corrupt practices within the system and lackadaisical attitudes among staff members. Furthermore, this lack of political will on behalf of the state government impedes progress towards developmental goals. Despite being created in 1967 as one of Nigeria's earliest states, Kwara State remains unimpressive in terms of development when compared to other states created around the same time or even those established much later.

According to a report by the Kwara State Government (2023), there are a total of 43,696 employees working within its civil service sector; however, this number is deemed inadequate given that it falls short for serving the entire population residing in-state. A breakdown reveals that only 21.16% (9,305 individuals) work directly for core civil services while Teaching Service Commission accounts for 21.34% (9,384 individuals). Meanwhile, SUBEB employ about 50.13% (21,906 individuals) and non-academic parastatals account for roughly 7.05% (3,101 individuals). Amongst core civil service employees specifically: management comprises approximately 30%, intermediate positions make up about 47%, and junior-level workers constitute roughly 23%. It is also noteworthy that many public-sector entities such as State-Owned Enterprises and parastatals struggle with financial stability or operate below their required capacities according to official reports from Kwara State government authorities (2023). In light of these challenges faced by various agencies dependent upon governmental subvention just for survival purposes alone, Kwara state must consider privatization options moving forward amidst pressing needs for change across multiple sectors.

Numerous issues within the public service in the State stem from problems related to management and procedures in government services, as well as poor performance among workers, inadequate incentives, and a lack of diligence among others. The civil service can be

characterized as typically hierarchical, with senior management performing most administrative functions while delegating little overall responsibility to subordinate or intermediate staff. There has been an overall decline in basic competence among many civil servants due to insufficient regular training (at local, national, and international levels) and almost no career planning or development opportunities. Poor salary structures and working conditions have contributed significantly to low morale and a lack of motivation amongst many civil servants.

The government of Kwara State cannot function effectively without a proficient, well-organized, and outcome-driven civil service. It is imperative that the government takes swift measures to reinstate the honor and trustworthiness of the civil service in order to establish a goal-oriented workforce that can provide valuable advice and support to the government. To this end, immediate action must be taken by the government to ensure timely payment of salaries and enhance overall working conditions. Nonetheless, it is expected that all workers exhibit complete dedication and exceptional productivity as demanded by the government. These remarks were made by Dr. Bukola Saraki during a public event in 2003 while he was serving as executive governor of Kwara State.

The Civil Service, serving as the backbone of government operations, bears the weighty responsibility of facilitating governance and national development. As is true for government worldwide, adequate training and retraining programs are crucial to equip its human resources with the necessary skills to achieve optimal productivity levels and effectively address challenges in governance and management. The absence of such initiatives, coupled with poor management practices, god fatherism, corruption, nepotism, and an unsupportive work environment are among several factors that significantly impede productivity levels within the civil service and undermine quality service delivery.

Theoretical Framework

The Efficiency Wage Model proposed by Rebitzer and Taylor (1995) is utilized to depict the correlation between minimum wage and optimal worker effort. The model's functionality, however, depends on the level of monitoring intensity employed by a firm as well as how minimum wage affects turnover at the firm-level. According to Alexandre. (2022), Efficiency Wages Theory (EWT) explains downward wage rigidity at the microeconomic level, involuntary unemployment, labor market segmentation, and variations in wages across establishments or industries where workers are engaged. The author further asserts that this theory provides empirical evidence indicating that employee salaries affect their productivity or quality one way or another; thus, certain restrictions prevent optimal employment contracts such as bonding. As a second-best solution for employers seeking to recruit top talent while retaining and motivating existing employees, compensation above the market clearing level is set.

Despite the abundance of empirical studies that support the positive effects of efficiency wages, there are numerous other studies with opposing views. These counterarguments suggest that the evidence supporting efficiency wages is not persuasive enough and remains inconclusive due to several inconsistencies in empirical testing. To determine the fate of efficiency wage theory, it is necessary to consider a diverse range of studies. However, when analyzed asymmetrically, a strong correlation between robust salaries or wages and increased worker productivity has not been found. This may be because individual personal qualities or potential have more impact on productivity than salary alone. While laboratory experiments have produced some evidence in favor of efficiency wage theory by showing that high wages lead to

higher levels of worker productivity, these results have been challenged by recent empirical evidence (Cardella et al, 2022). As such, some findings do not provide support for the fair wage-effect hypothesis. Critics also argue that laboratory subjects' behaviour may not accurately reflect real-life phenomena. Additionally, some studies have reported negative relationships between higher wages and alternative means of regulating employees' effort (such as supervision), which aligns with predictions made by the shirking model of efficiency wages. It should be noted that quasi-experimental designs used in many studies limit their generalizability beyond specific labor markets (Alexandre, 2022).

Factors Influencing Productivity or Performance in Civil Service

There is no single factor exclusively responsible for the low productivity in civil service. Rather, various factors contribute to poor employee performance, including but not limited to working conditions, employer-employee relationships, training and development opportunities, job security, and company policies regarding rewarding employees. Of all these factors affecting civil servants' performance, motivation through rewards is considered one of the most important (Esione et al., 2020). Recent literature on factors influencing employee performance has identified motivation (reward) as the most effective means of increasing organizational productivity (Koca et al 2024). Similarly, Magableh et al (2022) reported that reward systems are designed to elicit maximum performance from every employee while encouraging them to remain committed and serving as a mechanism for retaining the most productive staff among labor force.

Over time, organizations enhance their employees' performance and productivity by providing fair compensation and rewards. In the current dynamic business environment where competition is fierce, companies that wish to remain competitive must improve wages and salaries for their workers. Vroom's expectancy model suggests that employees perform more productively when their pay is linked to objectively evaluated performance measures. Shield et al (2020) argues that if an organization takes too long to address employee performance issues, it can lead other workers to lose motivation or even quit during active service years (Magableh et al 2022). Consequently, managers (and employees) may perceive performance differently across different cultures; thus objective and measurable effort and performance criteria are necessary (Saryalmo et al, 2022). Companies with high-performance business strategies recognize the importance of having managers who can identify talent, opportunities for growth, and career paths for their staff members. Therefore modern organizations need to focus on implementing motivational strategies such as training programs, job performance appraisals, proper compensation plans as well as career development initiatives coupled with teamwork among colleagues in order to improve employee productivity Charles et al (2019), Thevanes & Mangaleswaran (2018). There is evidence indicating improved worker productivity when they receive adequate motivation through encouragement and appropriate compensation while working within an organization.

Lateef et al. (2021) asserted that the compensation package provided to civil servants including salary, allowances, job security, regular promotions and in-service training programs as well as increased responsibilities, authority and accountability have a significant impact on their performance in Kwara State. Their study also found that regular promotion is a strong motivator of performance. The authors further concluded that consistent promotions and

incremental increases in take-home pay are the primary factors influencing the performance of civil servants.

Employee performance is an essential aspect used by government organizations to measure human resources' contribution in ministries and government agencies (Setyo & Johan, 2021). Thus, government agencies strive to provide excellent governance services. Bureaucratic reform is one such effort undertaken by governments to achieve good governance through fundamental reforms concerning institutional (organizational), management and human resource aspects of the civil apparatus.

It should be noted that civil servants across various ministries and government agencies are expected to demonstrate competence, loyalty, and productivity while maximizing their performances. Several research-based evidences suggest that an individual's ability to motivate oneself positively influences their work commitment towards organizational goals along with carrying out assigned mandates with discipline and responsibility. Recent research works have shown that employees' commitment towards an organization can significantly improve employee performance leading to better organizational outcomes than before (Eliyana et al., 2019). Hasanah & Lo (2020) opine that employer-provided motivation coupled with personal happiness or sense of duty can strengthen employee motivation leading them towards competitive advantage at work. Public employees who display high levels of self-discipline along with other personal qualities tend to experience job satisfaction leading them toward sustained morale which thereby enhances their workplace performances (Suprapti et al., 2020; Hasanah & Lo, 2020).

The research conducted by Okoye, Mbagwu, Moneke and Abanum (2018) has revealed that enhancing the working conditions of employees including regular payment of salaries, improved wages and job security can mitigate complaints and absenteeism while boosting productivity. In a meta-analysis endeavouring to explore low income and productivity among public sector workers, Yu (2022) discovered that countries with poor employee motivation experienced limited growth in productivity. However, although wages and salaries could significantly impact productivity in less developed economies, they may not have a significant effect on developed economies where modern technologies and other forms of incentives exist to ease work for employees (Owolabi et al., 2020). The above review highlights two crucial motivators - internal or self-motivation as well as external motivation - which contribute to high levels of employee productivity. Employers should thus strive to encourage both forms of motivation amongst individuals if they aim to maintain good organizational performance.

Measures of Productivity or Performance in Civil Service

Productivity concerns the relationship between input and output, but this definition does not fully address public sector productivity. A broader interpretation of productivity encompasses the outcomes achieved by the public sector (Liyanage et al., 2020). Employee performance has become a concern for individuals, organizations, and society as a whole. Owolabi et al. (2020) argue that employee productivity is determined by both quantity and quality of services rendered by an individual or group assigned to it. However, determining actual productivity can be challenging due to varying duties across different sectors or entities. Nwankwo (2022) and Bello (2015) contend that effectiveness and performance are dependent on an employee's skills while on duty. Okeke et al. (2017) suggest assessing employee performance

in the public sector using "Assessment Performance Appraisal," a standardized staff measuring instrument designed according to organizational goals. Samoni (2021) argues that economies rely heavily on the public sector for goods, services, and labor; worldwide bureaucracy indicators show that it accounts for 25% of global GDP and 38% of formal employment. Improving efficiency in this area could have significant implications for economic growth. Measuring productivity in the public sector involves tracking input-to-output ratios over time at various levels - individual employees, organizations, or overall sectors - which allows policymakers to identify high-performing individuals/organizations/entities within these areas while also examining correlations with good performance levels against expenditures.

However, Samoni notes how tricky measuring such metrics can be due to differences in duties across sectors/entities involve

- i. Market transactions for public services are frequently absent or distorted by subsidies and other market imperfections.
- ii. Numerous public services are intricate, necessitating inputs from multiple individuals and organizations that may be difficult to measure.
- iii. Moreover, a significant time lag often exists between the investment in inputs and the realization of outputs and outcomes.

The recent publication by the World Bank presents an overview of diverse methods for measuring productivity in the public sector (Samoni, 2021). To simplify matters, these approaches are classified into macro and micro categories. Macro approaches furnish aggregate information at the level of an organization, sector or service as a whole. In contrast, micro measures can be applied to individual employees, tasks, projects and processes. It is important to note that there is no one-size-fits-all solution for accurately gauging public sector productivity; each approach has its own limitations. For instance, cost-weighted-output requires activity-level data and necessitates different methodologies for various sectors resulting in metrics with difficult-to-interpret absolute levels. Project-completion rates require access to project-level data and may not fully account for differences in quality or complexity among projects. The publication provides a list of pros, cons and implementation requirements for each approach.

To develop a comprehensive understanding of public-sector productivity three core recommendations are presented:

1. Complement traditional macro measures with fine-grained micro measures at both individual employee and organizational levels.
2. Monitor performance output (measures) separately from costs inputs.
3. Combine multiple productivity measurements closely tied to conceptual service-delivery chains.

Research Questions

To guide this study, one research question is posed:

1. What is the effect of the newly implemented minimum wage on workers' productivity in Ilorin metropolis?

Research Hypotheses

The present study formulated these null hypotheses:

H0₁: There is no significant difference among genders regarding how much new minimum wage implementation affects worker's productivity in Ilorin metropolis.

H0₂: There is no significant difference among cadres regarding how much new minimum wage implementation affects worker's productivity in Ilorin metropolis.

Problem of the Present Study

Nigeria is grappling with numerous challenges in various aspects of life, including unprecedented industrial actions among civil servants that exacerbate the stress experienced by ordinary citizens due to poor service delivery. The declining level of employee productivity poses a serious threat to the efficient functioning and survival of Nigeria's civil service. This situation may be attributed to inadequate incentives provided for civil servants in the country. Despite being commonly referred to as a "civil servant state," Kwara State ranks among the lowest paid states in Nigeria, with economic consequences affecting its population. As such, workers in this state have low morale when compared to their counterparts from neighboring states and perceive their salaries as poor.

As suggested by Owolabi, et al (2020), factors such as poor salaries, late payment of monthly salaries, lack or inadequacy of bonuses and allowances, delayed pensions and gratuity payments, insufficient staff welfare provisions, inadequate working tools and facilities along with an uncondusive work environment contribute significantly towards low morale among employees leading to job dissatisfaction. The state appears susceptible to all these conditions which can result in negative attitudes towards work performance including lack of commitment resulting from tardiness amongst workers within its civil service sector. The present study seeks to establish how far-reaching the impact has been on past practices since implementing #30 000 minimum wage for civil servants within Kwara State while also examining its implications on productivity levels throughout this region

Methodology

The researcher implemented a descriptive survey methodology for the study, which aimed to examine the impact of the newly introduced minimum wage of #30,000.00 on civil servant productivity in Kwara State's Ilorin metropolis. To achieve this goal, both purposive and random sampling techniques were utilized to select a total of 240 participants from three parastatals and ministries within the aforementioned region (Kwara State Teaching Service Commission, Kwara State Environmental Protection Agency, Kwara State Water Corporation, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Works and Transport and Ministry of Finance and Planning).

The research employed a self-designed questionnaire referred to as the "Civil Service Productivity Measure Questionnaire, CSPMQ," which was developed based on an extensively reviewed background information about the subject matter. The instrument used for data collection was validated by four seasoned experts in education whose suggestions were incorporated into the final draft, confirming its validity. To test for reliability, the test-retest method was utilized among 20 respondents with similar characteristics of the study sample who did not participate in the study. After three weeks, the instrument was re-administered and correlated using Pearson Moment Correlation Coefficient (PPMC), resulting in a .79 reliability coefficient. Data were analyzed using Pearson Moment Correlation Coefficient (PPMC). Frequency and percentage were utilized to analyze respondents' demographic characteristics while descriptive statistics answered the primary research question. However, corresponding hypotheses H01 and H02 were not addressed to avoid repetitive results. The three hypotheses formulated for this study underwent analysis through inferential statistic of t-test at a significance level of 0.05.

Results

The study examined the impacts of the newly implemented #30,000.00 minimum wage of civil service in Ilorin metropolis in Kwara State, Nigeria. The study examined further the influence of gender and cadre in service on the respondents views of the subject matter.

Demographic Characteristics of the Respondents

This section presents demographic data of the respondents using frequency count and percentages.

Table 1

Frequency distribution of demographic characteristics of the respondents

Variable		Frequency	Percentage %
Gender	Male	138	57.5
	Female	102	42.5
	Total	240	100.0
Carder in Service	Senior	196	82.0
	Junior	44	18.0
	Total	240	100

Table 1 indicated that a total number of 240 civil servants from three different parastatals and three ministries in Ilorin metropolis, Kwara State, Nigeria, participated in the study. From the table presented above male participants were 138 representing (57.5%) while the female respondents were 102 representing (42.5%). It can therefore be deduced from the above table that male participants were more than the female participants in the study with a difference of 15%. The table shows further that the respondents who have attained the status of senior cadre are 196 representing (82.0%), while those in junior rank are 44 representing (18.0%) of the total participants.

Research Question 1:

What is the impact of newly implemented #30,000.00 minimum wage on productivity of civil servants in Ilorin metropolis, Kwara State?

Table 2

Mean and Rank Order of Responses on impact of new minimum wage productivity

S/N	Items:	Mean	Rank
1	Arrive at my work as promptly as possible and leave only by/or after the closing time	2.82	1 st
	Use the appropriate technology to do my work (e.g. computer)	2.78	2 nd
10	Work effectively with team	2.76	3 rd
9	Become more energetic/enthusiastic to meet deadline	2.68	4 th
5	Follow the laid down principles and rules in the work	2.66	5 th
16	Accommodate new functional Knowledge and skills	2.65	6 th
13	Complement the loss work hours to accomplish set standard	2.64	7 th
11	Come up with creative solutions to solve problems	2.62	8 th
6	Perform my duty in line with the goals of the organization	2.58	9 th
8	Never try to avoid hard tasks	2.56	10 th
14	Perform exactly what is expected of me	2.54	11 th
3	Do my work more diligently	2.50	12 th
19	Remove bottleneck/restricted access for efficient service delivery	2.48	13 th
17	Imbibe an improved service delivery spirit	2.44	14 th
15	Use appropriate problem solving skills	2.40	15 th
18	Help in reducing wastage	2.38	16 th
4	Finish all tasks assigned to me before leaving the office every day	2.32	17 th
8	Never try to avoid hard tasks	2.30	18 th
12	Being meticulous/thorough in carrying any task that is assigned to me	2.26	19 th
2	Do my primary assignment with honesty (Avoid corrupt practices	2.22	20 th

From the table 2 in the above, it is indicated that the new minimum wage has relative impact on the productivity among the civil servants in Ilorin metropolis. This decision is informed by a few number of the items on the rank table (i.e. twelve out of twenty) that have a mean score marginally above the benchmark value of 2.50. However, out of the 20 items contained in the instrument, items 4, 7, 10 with the mean scores of 2.82, 2.78 and 2.76 lead the rank table and as such; they are being ranked 1st, 2nd and 3rd respectively. The items highlighted as follows: “Arrive at my work as promptly as possible and leave only by/or after the closing time”; “Use the appropriate technology to do my work (e.g. computer)” and “Work effectively with team ” as the most reported impacts of the new minimum wage on civil service productivity among the respondents. On the other side of the rank table, items 8, 12 and 2 with the mean values of 2.30, 2.26, and 2.22 make the least ranked items, and they were ranked 18th, 19th and 20th respectively. These items are worded as follows: “Never try to avoid hard tasks”; “Being meticulous/thorough in carrying any task that is assigned to me” and “Do my primary assignment with honesty (i.e. Avoid any form of corrupt practice)”.

Hypotheses Testing:

Hypothesis One: *There is no significant difference in the impact of minimum wage on productivity in the civil service in Ilorin metropolis, Kwara State, Nigeria based on gender.*

Table 3

Mean, SD and t-test results showing difference in the impact of minimum wage on productivity in the civil service in Ilorin metropolis, Kwara State, Nigeria based on gender.

Gender	N	Mean	SD	Df	Cal. t	Crit. t	p-value
Male	138	34.25	18.48	238	1.35	1.96	0.241
Female	102	19.43	16.82				

Table 3 shows that the calculated t- value of 1.35 is less than the critical t-value of 1.96 at the degree of freedom of 238, with a corresponding p-value of 0.241 which is on the other hand greater than the value of significance of 0.05. However, this result indicated that there is no significant difference in the impact of the minimum wage on productivity in the civil service in Ilorin metropolis, Kwara State, Nigeria on the basis of the respondents' gender. Hence, the null hypothesis which stated that there is no significant difference the impact of the minimum wage on productivity in the civil service in Ilorin metropolis, Kwara State, Nigeria on the basis of gender is retained. This implies that gender has no significant influence on the respondents' views of the subject matter.

Hypothesis Two:

There is no significant difference in the impact of minimum wage on productivity in the civil service in Ilorin metropolis, Kwara State, Nigeria based on cadre in service.

Table 4

Mean, SD and t-test results showing difference in the impact of minimum wage on productivity in the civil service in Ilorin metropolis, Kwara State, Nigeria based on cadre in service

Gender	N	Mean	SD	Df	Cal. t	Crit. t	p-value
Senior	196	28.42	12.66	238	2.24	1.96	0.000
Junior	44	9.43	8.42				

Table 4 shows that the calculated t- value of 2.24 is greater than the critical t-value of 1.96 at the degree of freedom of 238, with a corresponding p-value of 0.000 which is on the other hand less than the significance level of 0.05. However, this result indicated that there is significant difference in the impact of the minimum wage on productivity in the civil service in Ilorin metropolis, Kwara State, Nigeria on the basis of the respondents' cadre in service. Hence, the null hypothesis which stated that there is no significant difference the impact of the minimum wage on productivity in the civil service in Ilorin metropolis, Kwara State, Nigeria on the basis

of cadre in service is rejected. This implies further that respondent's cadre in service has significant influence on their views of the subject of the study.

Discussion of the Findings

The study's findings indicate that the recently implemented minimum wage for civil servants in Ilorin metropolis has had a minimal impact on their productivity. The study reveals that the primary impacts are prompt arrival and departure from work, using appropriate technology such as computers, and effective teamwork. These findings support previous studies conducted by Okoye et al. (2018), Mbagwu et al., Moneke et al., Abanum (2017), Okeke et al., Nwele, Achilike (2020) and Owolabi et al. (2020).

Hypothesis one suggests there is no significant difference in how male or female civil servants perceive the minimum wage's impact on productivity based on respondents' gender. This finding aligns with previous research by Okeke et al. (2017) but contrasts with Esione, Fabian & Chigbo's results.

Hypothesis two indicates a significant difference in how different cadres of civil servants perceive the minimum wage's effect on productivity based on respondents' position within the service. The researcher at the completion of this study was able to lay hands on any similar literature in the past that it may be due to experience disparities between senior and junior workers with varying levels of compensation at month-end.

Conclusion

In conclusion, while civil servants are regular at work, their overall level of output remains low despite implementing a new minimum wage policy. Other factors must be considered alongside remuneration to facilitate higher productivity since good salary alone does not guarantee high performance without effective monitoring and timely supervision. As humans prefer pleasure over hard work naturally, nothing tangible can be achieved without adequate oversight; thus this study concludes that newly implemented minimum wages have only marginally impacted Ilorin metropolis's civil service sector output-wise.

Recommendations

The study's findings suggest the following recommendations:

1. The government must ensure consistent and timely payment of civil servant salaries within the state.
2. Remuneration should reflect the economic reality of society, in order to align with its values.
3. Other factors that promote efficient service delivery, such as access to loans, a conducive work environment and modern technology adoption, should be prioritized.
4. Effective monitoring and supervision practices must be implemented within the civil service sector to identify areas for support and reinforcement.

References

- Agbodike, C. F., Osawe, O. C. & Igbkwe-Ibeto, C. J. (2015). The civil service and democratic governance in Nigeria : Issues, prospects and new hopes. *Academic Journal of Research in Economics and Management* 2 1-13.
- Alexandre, F., Bação, P., & Veiga, F. J. (2022). The political economy of productivity growth. *European Journal of Political Economy*, 75(1),102185.

- Ameen, L., Abdulkareem, A.K. & Bello, M.L. (2016). An Appraisal of the Role of Promotion in the Performance of Civil Servants in Kwara State Civil Service Nigeria Available Online on: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/331166535>
- Cardella, E., & Roomets, A. (2022). Pay distribution preferences and productivity effects: An experiment. *Journal of behavioural and Experimental Economics*, 96, 101814.
- Charles, V., Gherman, T., & Paliza, J. C. (2019). Stakeholder involvement for public sector productivity enhancement: Strategic considerations. *ICPE Public Enterprise Half-Yearly Journal*, 24(1), 77-86.
- Eliyana, A., Ma'arif, S. & Muzakki, D. (2019). Job satisfaction and organizational commitment effect in the transformational leadership towards employee performance. *European Research on Management and Business Economics*, 25, 144–150. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.iemeen.2019.05.001>
- Esione, U. O., Fabian, C.O. & Chigbo, D.N. (2020). Effect of reward on performance of workers in the Nigerian public sector. *International Journal of Trend in Scientific Research and Development (IJTSRD)*, 4 (2): 409-424. Available Online: www.ijtsrd.com e-ISSN: 2456 – 6470.
- Hasanah, F., & Lo, S.J. (2020). The mediating role of employee satisfaction on the influences of employee discipline and employee motivation on employee performance at the Ministry of Transportation, Republic of Indonesia, Research and Development Department. Dinasti. *International Journal of Management Science*, 2, (1): 1–11. <https://doi.org/10.31933/dijms.v2i1.512>
- Koca, D., & Van Deursen, A. (2024). Factors Affecting Worker Skills Required in Digital Transformations of SMEs: Case Studies in the Netherlands and Türkiye. In *Digital Transformation and Sustainable Development in Cities and Organizations* (pp. 54-80). IGI Global.
- Kwara State Government (2004). *The Seed Development Process*. Ilorin: Kwara State Planning Commission Publication.
- Lateef, A., Azeez, M. A., Suaibu, O. B., & Adigun, G. O. (2021). A decade of nanotechnology research in Nigeria (2010–2020): a scientometric analysis. *Journal of Nanoparticle Research*, 23, 1-27.
- Liyanage, P. M. T. S. K., & Ekanayake, E. A. (2020). Developing a Framework for Productivity Measurement in Sri Lankan Public Sector; Insights from Literature
- Magableh, S., Alalawneh, M., & Alqalawi, U. (2022). An empirical study on the effect of education on labor productivity. *Journal of Governance and Regulation/Volume*, 11(2)..
- Merriam-Webster.com Dictionary (2022). Civil servant. Available Online on: <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/civil%20servant>. Accessed 23 Aug. 2022
- Nwankwo, H., Mason, J., Costa, M. L., Parsons, N., Redmond, A., Parsons, H., ... & Kearney, R. S. (2022). Cost-utility analysis of cast compared to removable brace in the management of adult patients with ankle fractures. *Bone & Joint Open*, 3(6), 455-462.
- Obasa, F. (2015). Low income and diminishing productivity in Nigeria public sector. *Arts Social Science*, 6, (3): 2-8.
- Okeke, P.A., Nwele, J.O. & Achilike, N.I. (2017). Impact of effective wages and salary administration on civil service productivity in Nigeria: A study of Anambra State. *Asian Journal of Applied Science and Technology (AJAST)*, 1,421-438.

- Okoye, I.B., Mbagwu, F.C., Moneke, P. & Abanum, R. (2018). Indices of working conditions as determinant of job performance of librarians in academic libraries in South-East Nigeria. *International Journal of Library and Information Science*, 10, (5): 45-53.
- Owolabi, R.A., Durosaro, D.O. & Oyeniran, D. (2020). Good condition of service: Nostrum to staff effectiveness in Nigeria public service. *Al-Hikmah Journal of Education (AJE)*, 7, (2): 74-80. ISSN 2384-7662, E-ISSN 2705-2508.
- Pan, W., Xie, T., Wang, Z., & Ma, L. (2022). Digital economy: An innovation driver for total factor productivity. *Journal of Business Research*, 139, 303-311.
- Samoni, R. (2021). How can we measure productivity in the public sector? Available Online on: <https://blogs.worldbank.org/governance/how-can-we-measure-productivity-in-ouublic-sector>
- Saryatmo, M. A., & Sukhotu, V. (2021). The influence of the digital supply chain on operational performance: a study of the food and beverage industry in Indonesia. *Sustainability*, 13(9), 5109.
- Setyo, R. & Johan, H.P. (2021). Factors affecting civil servant performance in Indonesia. *International Journal of Entrepreneurship*, 25: 1-15.
- Suprapti, S., Astuti, P.A., Sa'adah, N., Rahmawati, S.D., Astuti, R.Y., Sudargini, Y. (2020). The Effect of Work Motivation, Work Environment, Work Discipline on Employee Satisfaction and Public Health Center Performance. *Journal Industrial Engineering & Management Research (Jiemar)*, 1, (2): 2722–8878.
- Thevanes, N. & Mangaleswaran, T. (2018). Relationship between Work-Life Balance and Job Performance of Employees. *IOSR Journal of Business and Management*, 20, (5): 11-16. DOI:10.9790/487X-2005011116
- Wikipedia, the Online Free Encyclopedia (2021). Civil Service. Available Online on: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Civil_service
- Yu, B. (2022). The impact of the internet on industrial green productivity: evidence from China. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 177, 121527.