QUANTITATIVE PERSPECTIVE OF THE IMPERATIVE OF CUSTOMER SERVICE DELIVERY ON CUSTOMER RELATION AND ATTRACTION IN NIGERIAN STORE-BASED RETAIL BUSINESS

ADEBAYO Adeyemi Abdulwasiu, PhD

Department of Business and Entrepreneurship,
Kwara State University, Malete
adeyemi.adebayo@kwasu.edu.ng
Orcid.org/0009-0002-3055-1279
+2348060351895

Abstract

This study investigated the effect of customer service delivery on customer relationships in selected retail businesses in Lagos state, Nigeria. Quantitative technique was used as a research design; the population size was infinite. Survey means through a questionnaire was used to gather the primary data; Godden's (2004) model sample size was adopted and 246 were arrived as sample size, multistage sampling technique was employed in the study. Out of the 246 copies of the questionnaire that were administered, 150 were finally retrieved and coded for data analysis. Standard multiple regression (SPSS version 26) was adopted to analyze the data. The conclusion of the study shows that there is likelihood for retail firms to build enthusiastic customer relations that will undoubtedly lead to customer desirability and loyalty when the retail firms are able to devise a good and satisfactory customer service delivery pattern that is customer-oriented. The study suggested that service providers have to work on customer service delivery plan that will have the objective of generating lasting customer relations with the objectives of attracting new customers, maintaining the existing ones, build brand awareness and improve customer and employee retention.

Keywords: Complaints Handling, Customer Relationship, Customers' Patronage, Customer Service, Retail

1.   Introduction

Customer service is all about meeting and going beyond the expectations of service providers' target customers. The significance and involvement of the retail sector in any nation's economy can never be ignored in recent years. Retailing consist all the activities that embrace the process of selling products and services to meet an individual need of the final consumer (Adebayo, 2023). Such activities as sales, order processing, merchandising, inventory management, supply chain management etc.

Retailing generally contributes about 5.8% to the compound annual growth rate (CAGR) of Nigeria's economy (Marketreasearch.com, 2021). The sector which comprises the activities of both wholesales and retails are the third largest contributors to nation's GDP, contributing about 16 percent of the total (Obayagbona, 2022). The sector is also one of the largest contributors to employment opportunities in Nigeria despite the government reliance on revenue from crude oil and gas.

 To meet this customer's desire, this calls for the considerate of customers' needs and how these needs could be profitably met in a way that would pledge customer desirability and repeat purchase. Customer service entails all those activities performed by the retail service provider that positively affect the ease at which an intending customer can patronize an outlet or gain knowledge of about what the retailer offers. The effortlessness at which a transaction can be completed without delay by the potential customer and attempts to purchase to be ease and the customer satisfaction that will emanate with the transaction (Parasuraman et al., 1994 cited in Jain & Gupta, 2004).

Customer service management is considered to be the sole responsibility of the retail service providers and not restricted to individual in an organisation. And that is the more reason why future profitable retail service provider will realise that the demand of their offerings is not just only price elastic as opined by economists but also service elastic. Furthermore, because of the need of the service providers to put up a loyal customer that will be over and over again patronizing their stores, the store-based retail outlets service providers have repeatedly involved in personalizing the customer experience. This is indispensable since a large part of the store-based retail customers would desire to purchase from outlets that offer some type expect personalized service. Customers expect personalized offers based on their inclinations. With this lofty loyalty program, the retail outlets would find it more expedient to maintain track of their customer's buying habits, brand and product preferences and offer them appropriate rewards.

These days, due to the forceful competition in the retail sector operating in brick-and-mortar, valuable, modern and good service quality guarantees consumer satisfaction which at the end of the day leads to customer loyalty. Many retailing organisations have stirred from product-centric to customer-centric marketing to provide want-satisfying products and services to their esteem customers. The foremost major factor in every customer-centric organisation is a superior customer satisfaction programme that will pledge an organizational level of success.

Furthermore, parts of the dilemma experienced in store-based retail outlets today is the call for the customization of products and services from the service providers of retail outlets. Customers prove very demanding and they are persistently and gradually searching for special and exceptional knowledge that will allow them to have and modify their own products. The customization approach of customers' service encourages service providers to adapt the service to meet each customer's personal needs (Banwari & Walfried, 1996 cited in Levy & Weitz, 2012).

In addition, as suggested by Palmer (2010), one of the significant ways to achieve competitive advantage and build a formidable customer relationship with retail customers is by successfully managing the experience of these customers. In this perspective,

customer experience emerges as new phenomenon which also motivated customer to patronize some retail outlets for shopping. Moreover, as evidenced by Oracle in the year 2012, research findings show that 89 per cent of the customer will defect to competitor's business as result of poor customer experience emanated from poor customer service delivery. Taking this into account, this study is trying to examine the extent at which customer service delivery relates with customer relations and attraction in store – based retail outlets in Nigeria with special reference to the selected retail firms in Lagos state metropolis.

2.0 Review of Relevant Literature

2.1 Conceptual Review

2.1.1 Customer Service

Consumers are very important asset because no institution or company will be able to survive when ignored by their customers. Customer Service is one of the most important activities carried out by the retail firm because it involves the future course of the company (Tax et al., 2013). Kotler (2006) postulates customer service as different things to different people and according to different circumstances. Lalonde and Zinser (1976) conceptualize customer service as the variety of activities between the organisation and customers to improve or simplify sales and using of products and services. It also involves the operations of service providers for customers during the whole transaction. From this assertion, it is noted that customer service is not only limited to the effort of service providers in the exchange process with the consumers but extends to giving information to the customer on how the products will be consumed and other things thereafter which is known as post-sales services in marketing.

The role of customer service to create customer loyalty by providing quality service to its customers is to implement a Customer Relationship Management (Sam, 2019). In retailing business, the execution of CRM in formulating effective communication with the customer seems very important in delivering superior services to its customers as this can be the starting point of acquiring new customers, maintaining and developing existing customers (Wirtz et al., 2016).

Rinehart et al. (1998) assert that customer service is assumed to be a common factor for the integration of marketing and logistics. This opinion justifies customer service as a unifying variable in ensuring that the want pleasing products and services produced by a company get to the final consumers at the right time and in the right form. This is in contrast with the position of Boove and Thill (1992) cited in Kanovska (2010) that perceives customer service as what all organisations make for satisfaction of the customer and helps to realize the big advantage the customers enjoy by purchasing the products or services. The study further added that customer services are also actions that can add more value to the product purchased and finally consumed by the customers. Customer service is also viewed by Buchanan (2011) as the provision of service to customers before, during and after purchase while the discernment of its success and achievement depends on the staff who can adjust themselves to the personality of the customers. The

capability of a service provider to increase returns and create more sales rests exclusively on firm's magnitude of customer service.

2.1.2 Customer Relationship Management

Customer relations are marketing principle that has a connection with the organisation's shareholders. Coehlo and Henseler (2012) conceptualised customer relations as a fundamental tool that are planned to achieve corporate objectives and develop a sustainable competitive advantage by entering the market of marketing programs that are used to serve the target markets.

Customer relationship management (CRM) is a management technique that connects and patterns information technology with marketing. It was first used in the United States in the late 1990's, and till date, has been acknowledged in a various number of companies globally. In difference, some people have unenthusiastic impressions of CRM; such opinions hold that it is complex to execute successfully and that its cost-benefit performance is meager, among other condemnations. That notwithstanding, customer relationship management (CRM) is a generally known, widely implemented strategy for managing and fostering a company's relations with customers, clients and sales prospects to pledge incessant patronage. It also involves using expertise to organize, automate, and harmonize business processes, primarily sales activities, but also those for marketing, customer service, and technical support (Zamil, 2011).

Customer Relationship Management (CRM) focus on the worth that customer gets rather than the products or services to be put up for sale by the company. Through the execution of Customer Relationship Management (CRM), companies are expected to be able to set up communication and a better-quality relationship with their treasured customers. This circumstance is also anticipated that the company will not only market a product and service with good quality and competitive prices but also be able to answer customers' desires and needs as opined by Indah (2013) which can lead to satisfaction and customer loyalty.

2.2   Empirical Review

Adebayo (2023) conducted a study to scrutinize the implication of atmospheric ambience on customers' experience in service marketing with a special concentration on store-based retail businesses. The quantitative method was used as a research design the population size was the customers of 19 retail outlets in the Lagos state metropolis. A survey method through a questionnaire was used to collect the primary data; Godden's(2004) model sample size was adopted and 246 was determined as the sample size, convenience sampling techniques was employed in the study. Out of the 246 copies of the questionnaire that were administered, 150 were finally retrieved and coded for data analysis. Standard multiple regression was adopted to analyze the data. The conclusion of the study shows that retail store ambience is conceivably one of the most major factors in attracting and retaining customer and enhancing customer experience. The study recommended that retail stores practitioners should try as much as possible to emphasise more on ways of improving their retail store environment.

Research carried out by Juanamasta et al. (2019) to examine the problems company faced that make a company to have appalling image and cheapen the levels of consumer loyalty. The research study applied the use of qualitative method, and also makes use of Positivism, Naturalistic and Interpretative research philosophies. The data for the research was collected using interviews, documentation, and observation methods.

Kursunluoglu (2011) conducted a research work titled "Customer Service Effects on customer satisfaction and customer loyalty: A field research in shopping centers in Izmir city in Turkey". The intention of the research work is to review customer service effects on customer satisfaction and customer loyalty. The field study is applied by using survey methods on a face-to-face and electronic mail basis as interview methods including four hundred shopping mall customers who live in Izmir city in Turkey. The research model is formed for measuring customer service effects on customer satisfaction and customer loyalty. The research model is tested by three hypotheses via regression analyses. The results explain that 13.9% of the variance in customer satisfaction, 12.5% of the variance in customer loyalty and also customer satisfaction can explain 43.2% of the variance in customer loyalty. Consequently, customer services can explain both customer satisfaction and customer loyalty as it must be improved by retailers.

Teshita and Gemedi (2021) conducted a research work to examine the customers' relationship management practices on customer retention and loyalty of Oromia credit and savings share company in Bule Hora city Ethiopia. The study makes use of simple random sampling technique. The data collected through the questionnaire were analyzed using descriptive statistical analysis and inferential statistics methods by using SPSS version 20 for analyzing the data collected. The study revealed that the four customer relationship management dimensions are strongly related and customer relationship management has a significant relationship on customer retention and loyalty of the company.

Suleiman (2018) examined a study to determine the effect of customer relationship management (CRM) on customer satisfaction and its effect on customer loyalty of Islamic Bank in Aceh's Province. The population of the study embraces all the customers of the Bank. The study adopts the use of convenience random sampling with a sample size of 250 respondents. The data collected was analysed through a structural equation model (SEM). The outcome from the analysis reveals that customer relationship management has considerable influences on both satisfaction and customer loyalty as satisfaction also affects customer loyalty to the bank. The study further reveals that customer satisfaction plays an important role as well as a fractional mediator between the influences of customer relationship management on customer loyalty. The implications of the study shows that the management of Bank needs to work on how to develop its customer relationship management programs that can perk up customer loyalty.

Karyose et al. (2017) investigated a study aimed at analysing the influence of service quality, corporate image, and customer relationship marketing on customer satisfaction and customer loyalty. The population of the study consisted of 180 bank customers in Malang city of Indonesia. Structural Equation Model (SEM) was used to analyse the data gathered. The results of the analysis revealed that service quality, corporate image, and customer relationship marketing has influence on customer satisfaction, and service

quality, corporate image. More so, customer relationship marketing has significant influence on customer loyalty. In addition, customer satisfaction has effects on customer loyalty and Customer satisfaction mediates the effect of service quality, corporate image, and customer relationship marketing on customer loyalty.

Ramdhani et al. (2017) conducted study to investigate the impact of service delivery on customer satisfaction. The study therefore shows that service providers offering high levels of customer services are in a strong position to attract new customers to their brand. The study further reveals that there is an inconsistent level customer service delivery that exists amongst dealerships which translates into the fact that there is difficulty being experienced by Ford automobile to ensure consistent levels of service across its dealer network and the fact that there is a gap in terms of service delivery in the automotive market for Ford.

Gbadeyan (2010) researched into Customer Relationship Management and Hospital Service Quality in Nigeria. The Objective of the study is to examine how customer relationships management can be employed to bring about improve health service quality in Nigeria. The data for the study was collected through questionnaire instrument administered to 200 health workers at the University of Ilorin Teaching Hospital Ilorin, Nigeria. Exploratory test was conducted to ascertain the mean age of the sample distribution, while Chi-square, Kolmogorov Smirnov test and Factor Analysis were used as a Statistical tools to further perform data analysis on the study. The findings of the study reveal that the mean age was not significantly different from the hypothesized value, customer relationship management (CRM) has significant effects on the quality of Hospital Services in Nigeria ($\chi2=0.000$, d.f=2 and $P \leq 0.05$). The study recommends pre-planning and understanding expectation of stakeholders for CRM successful implementation.

Almsalam (2014) investigated a study with the primary goal of analysing the relationship between two of the most important antecedents of customer satisfaction, namely customer expectation and perceived service quality and customer satisfaction. Data were collected through a survey, including samples of 250 customers from the 5 Banks in Damascus, Syria. SPSS was used to test the hypotheses. The finding shows that customer expectation and perceived service quality have a positive effect on customer satisfaction.

Sakar and Islam (2021) conducted a research study to explore the relationship between customer satisfaction and service quality of the commercial banks in Cumilla district. The total number of sample was 400 and the data for the study was collected by face to face interview using structured questionnaire method. Closed ended and open ended question were able to be used to gather data for the research work and total number of five hypotheses was used in relation with five major factors of SERQUAL model. The study concluded that the considered five factors play a significant role in improving the service quality.

3.0 Methodology

This study made use of quantitative method to evaluate the consequence and imperative of customer service delivery on customer relation and attraction of selected store-based

retail outlets in Lagos state. Survey technique was considered through a self-administered questionnaire in order to ascertain the perception and position of target beneficiaries about the imperative of customer service delivery on customer relation and attraction with evidence from selected store- based retail outlets in Lagos state Metropolis. A multistage sampling techniques was used through purposive sampling that was adopted to focus on the three major store based retail outlets (Shoprites, Spar and Buyrites) while availability sampling was used to determine customers that were available on weekend days when the research was conducted at all outlets of the selected retail stores in Lagos state. The final stage of the sampling was the stage of using the random sampling through mall intercept to select the respondents for the study and administer the questionnaire to the customers of the selected retail stores in Lagos state. And the instrument used for the analysis was SPSS.

3.1 Model Specifications

A model of the relationship is hypothesized, and estimates of the parameter values that are used to develop equations. The study is based on two major constructs, namely customer service delivery and customer relationship and attraction, that is,

$Y = f(X)$

Where Y = customer relationship and attraction.

X = customer service delivery

Model for the Hypothesis

CUR=f (CS) ....…… 3.1

CS =COH+PSS+ e... 3.2

      Substituting   (3.2) into (3.1)

CUR=f {COH+PSS}…..……… 3.3

$CUR_i = \alpha + \beta_1 ed_i + \beta_2 rd_i + u_i$ …………………………………………………...……. 3.4

Where:

CUR= Customer Relationship and attraction

CS= Customer Service delivery

Table 1 Validity Statistics

s/n	Validity Test	KMO	Barlett's Test	Sig.
1	Customer Service	.684	61.382	.000
2	Customer Relations	.735	77.221	.000

Table 2 Reliability Cronbach's Alpha Coefficients Table

Variables	Cronbach Alpha Coefficients
i. Customer Relations	.853
ii. Customer Service	.751

4.0 Research Findings/Results

4.1 Mean and Standard Deviation of the Customer Service Delivery

The mean and standard deviation indicated in Table 1 show that there are 10 items representing customer service delivery with two dimensions (complaint handling depicted in the table 1 as CH and post-sales services shown in the Table 3 as PSS). All the items recorded high levels of mean score. "Customers' patronage is aroused through immediate and instant response to the technical problem encountered by the customers" recorded the highest mean score (M = 4.16, SD = 1.093), whereas "Excellent post sales services increases the chances of a retail store in building customer loyalty" recorded a lowest mean score of (M = 3.95, SD = 1.101) respectively. This result shows that "Customers' patronage is aroused through immediate and instant response to technical problem encountered by the customers" is the main characteristic representing the customer service delivery in selected retail store in Lagos Nigeria.

Table 3: Mean and Standard Deviation of Customer Service Delivery

Code	Detail	Mean	SD
Complaints Handling			
CH1	Service provides effort in providing immediate and quick responses to questions raised by the customers to guarantee good customer relationship	4.15	.908
CH2	Timely response to customer's orders and transactions by the service providers' representatives enhances customer satisfaction	4.15	.925
CH3	Customers' patronage is aroused through immediate and instant responses to technical problems encountered by the customers	4.16	1.093
CH4	Ability of the retail officers to apologise to customer when mistakes are made enhance customer's repeat purchase	4.09	.976
CH5	Immediate handling of complain enhances customers' expectation	4.11	.914
Post Sales Services			
PSS1	Store-efficient post-sales services contribute to customer satisfaction	4.05	1.060
PSS2	Store quickly resolves problems in the delivery or receipt of products enhances customer attraction	4.01	1.141
PSS3	Store excellent post sales services increases the chances of retail store in building customer loyalty	3.95	1.101
PSS4	Store-effective post-sales services generate online reviews and recommendations	3.98	1.071
PSS5	Store brand image and product prestige are improved through excellent post-sales services	4.01	1.114

Sources: Field Survey, 2024

4.2 Mean and Standard Deviation of the Customer Relations

The mean and standard deviation indicated below reveal there are five items representing customer relation shown in the table 4 as CUR. All the items recorded high levels of mean score. "Customers' perception of the stores that celebrate customers on their birthdays and other festive periods build loyalty" recorded the highest mean score (M = 4.07, SD = 1.153), whereas "Customers are satisfied when service providers communicate with them through different platforms" recorded a lowest mean score of (M = 4.00, SD = 1.153) respectively. This result shows that "Customers' perception of store that celebrate customers on their birthdays and other festive periods build loyalty" is the main characteristic representing the customer relation in selected retail store in Lagos Nigeria.

Table 4: Mean and Standard Deviation of Customer Relations

Code	Detail	Mean	SD
CUR1	Good communication between the service providers and their customers guarantees customer loyalty	4.04	1.134
CUR2	A store that rewards loyal customers enjoys continuous patronage of customers	4.05	1.116
CUR3	Customers are satisfied when service providers communicate with them through different platforms	4.00	1.153
CUR4	Customers build trust in a retail firm that addresses customers' complaint and negative feedback swiftly	4.01	1.156
CUR5	Customers' perception of stores that celebrate customers on their birthdays and other festive periods builds loyalty	4.07	1.153

Sources: Field Survey, 2024

4.3 Regression Analysis and Hypotheses Test between Customer Service Delivery and Customer Relations

Multiple regression analysis was conducted in determining the relationship between customer service delivery (complaints handling and post sales services) and customer relation of selected store- based retail outlets in Lagos state Metropolis.

Table 5: Model Summary

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate	Durbin-Watson
1	.629[a]	.510	.496	.96751	1.902

a. Predictors: (Constant), Post sale Service, Complaints Handling

b. Dependent Variable: Customer Relations

Sources*: Researcher's Survey, 2024*

The model summary as indicated in table 5 above shows that R-Square is 0.510; this implies that 51% of variation in the dependent variable (customer relations) was explained by the customer service delivery variables (complaints handling and post sales services) while the remaining 49% is due to other variables that are not included in the model. This means that the regression (model formulated) is useful for making predictions.

Table 6: ANOVA[a]

Model		Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	12.904	2	7.472	8.910	.000[b]
	Residual	112.216	147	.839		
	Total	118.221	149			

a. Dependent Variable: Customer Relations

b. Predictors: (Constant), Post sale Service, Complaints Handling

Sources*: Researcher's Survey, 2024*

The Table 6 summarized the results of the analysis of variation in the customer relations with large value of regression sum of squares (12.904) in comparison to the residual sum of squares with value of 112.216. The result indicated that the model fit to explain a lot of the variation in the operation customer relation. Thus, the estimated F-value (8.910) as given in the Table 6 with significance value of 0.000, is less than p-value of 0.05 ($p<0.05$). This means that the customer service delivery as a whole can jointly influence change in the customer relations.

Table 7: Coefficients[a]

Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients		
		B	Std. Error	Beta	t	Sig.
1	(Constant)	2.167	.474		1.501	.000
	Complain Handling	.204	.093	.172	2.206	.029
	Post sale Service	.256	.074	.269	3.416	.001

a. Dependent Variable: Customer Relations

Sources*: Researcher's Survey, 2024*

The dependent variable as shown in the table 7 clarifies the influence of customer service delivery variables (complaints handling and post sales services) on the customer relation. This was used as a yardstick to examine the influence between the two independent variables.

5.   Discussions of Result

Specifically, Hypothesis H_1 predicted that complaints handling is positively related to customer relations. Result indicated that complaints handling had a significant positively relationship with customer relations (β = 0.204, t = 2.206, p = .029). The result revealed that the complaints handling will eventually serve as the determinant of customer relations. Therefore, Hypothesis H_1 is supported.

Hypothesis H_1 predicted that post sales services is positively related to customer relations. Result indicated that post sales services had a positive and significant relationship with customer relations (β = 0.256, t = 3.416, p = .001). Thus, the Hypothesis H_2 is supported at 5% level of significant. The overall summary of this regression analysis result in relations to the coefficient of customer service delivery have significant influence on customer relations of store- based retail outlets in Lagos state Metropolis in the area of complaints handling and post sales services). This implies that the null hypothesis was rejected, hence, the alternate hypotheses was accepted. Thus, customer service delivery has momentous influence on customer relations of store- based retail outlets in Lagos state Metropolis). The observed findings of the research conducted by Juanamasta et al. (2019), Kursunluoglu (2011), Gbadeyan (2010), Rhamdhani et al. (2017), Venkateswaran and Sundram (2021) are indifferent to the finding of this research work.

6.   Implications of Findings

The objective of the study was to determine the relationship between customer service delivery and customer relations in Nigerian retail outlets. The result of the multiple regression analysis conducted to test the hypothesis whether effective customer service delivery has important relationship on service provider's customer relations posture reveals that the sub-variables used to proxy the customer service delivery (complaint handling and post sales services) have significant influence on customer relations. The implication of this is that there is possibility for retail firms to build lasting customer relation and attraction that without doubt will lead to attraction and loyalty provided that the retail firms design a good and satisfactory customer service delivery model that is customer-oriented.

7.   Conclusion and Recommendations

The study shows that there is likelihood for retail firms to build dynamic customer relation that will unavoidably lead to customer desirability and loyalty when the retail firms are able to design a good and up to standard customer service delivery model that is customer-oriented. Therefore, swift reply to customer needs and grievance, effective and efficient order processing and provision of technical support are indispensable constituents which sustain service quality and customer loyalty. The study recommended that service providers as a matter of inevitability need to work on customer service delivery agenda that will have the objective of generating long lasting customer relation with the objectives of attracting new customers, maintaining the existing ones, create brand awareness and improve customer and employee retention.

Reference

Adebayo, A.A. (2023a). Thematic exploration of store atmospheric effect on customer experience-centric retail business. *Northwest Journal of Social and Management Sciences,* 4 (1), 80-90.

Adebayo, A.A. (2023b). Atmospheric ambience influence on customers' experience in service marketing. *Fuoye Journal of Management, Innovation and Entrepreneurship,* 2 (2), 13-22.

Almsalam, S. (2014). The effects of customer expectation and perceived service quality on customer satisfaction. *International Journal of Business and Management Invention*, 3 (8), 79-84.

Banwari, M. &Walfried, L. (1996). The role of personalization in service encounters. *Journal of Retailing,* 72(1), 95 – 109.

Boove, C. L. & Thill, J. V. (1992). *Study guide to accompany marketing*, Mc Graw Hill, 332.

Buchanan, J. & Michael, J. (2011). The efficacy of utilising Nvivo for interview data from the electronic gaming industry in two jurisdictions. *Review of Managemnet Innovation and Creativity,* 3(5), 1-15.

Gbadeyan, R. A. (2010). Customer relationship management and hospital service quality in Nigeria. *An International Multi-Disciplinary Journal, Ethiopia,* 4 (2), 168-184.

Indah, D. P. (2013). Analisa Pengaruh Customer relationship management terhadap Keunggulan Bersaing dan Kinerja Perusahaan, *Business Accounting Review*, 1, (2), 50-60.

Jain, S. K., & Gupta, G. (2004). Measuring service quality: SERVQUAL vs. SERVPERF scales. *Vikalpa*, *29*(2), 25-38.

Juanamasta, I. G., Wati, N. M. N., Hendrawati, E., Wahyuni, W., Pramudianti, M., Wisnujati, N. S., Setiawati, A. P., … Susetyorini, S., (2019). The role of customer service through customer relationship management (CRM) to increase customer loyalty and good image. *International Journal of Scientific & Technological Research*, 8(1), 1-5.

Karyose, H., Astuti, W, & Ferdiansjah, A. (2017). Customer loyalty: The effect of service quality, corporate image, customer relationship marketing and customer satisfaction as intervening variable-An empirical analysis of Bank customers in Malang City. *Marketing and Branding Research*, 4(2017), 336-347.

Kotler, P. (2006). *Marketing management*. New Jersey: Person Education.

Kursunluoglu, E. (2011) Customer service effect on customer satisfaction and customer loyalty: A field research on shopping centers in Izmir city-Turkey. *International Journal of Business and Social Sciences*, 2(17), 52-59.

Lalonde, B. J. & Zinzser, P. H. (1976). Customer service; Meaning and measurement. *National Council of Physical Distribution management, Chicago*, 156 – 159.

Levy, M. & Weitz, B.A. (2012). *Retailing management*. McGraw – Hill Irwin, New York.

Obayagbona, O. V. (2022). Nigeria's retail industry is on promising path of growth. *Business Day Newspaper*, August 18.

Oracle, (2012). Getting to the heart of the customer and brand relationship. *Customer Experience Impact Report*. 2012, 1-6.

Palmer, A. (2010). Customer experience management: A critical review of an emerging idea. *Journal of Services Marketing*, 24(3), 196–208.

Parasuraman, A., Zeithamal, V. A. & Berry, L.L. (1994), Reassessment of expectations as a comparison standard in measuring service quality: Implications for future research. *Journal of Marketing*, 58(13), 111- 124.

Ramdhani, A., Mayamana, X., & Karodia, A. N. (2017). Investigating the impact of service delivery on consumer satisfaction: A case study of ford Gauteng province (RSA). *Singaporean Journal of Business Economics and Management Studies*, 5(8), 1-30.

Rinehart, L. M., Bixby Cooper, M., & Wagenheim, G. D. (1989). Furthering the integration of marketing and logistics through customer service in the channel. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, *17*, 63-71.

Sam, B. (2019). Female feminism in the customary island of Buru, *International Journal of Science and Technological Research,* 8(8), 1877-1880

Sarkar, E. & Islam, M. S. (2021). Relationship between banking service quality and customer satisfaction of commercial banks in cumilla district, Bangladesh. *Journal of Public Values and Administration Insights,* 4(2), 105-127

Suleiman, S.M. (2018). Customer relationship management, customer satisfaction, and its impact on customer loyalty. *Proceedings of the 7ᵗʰ International Conference on Multidisciplinary Research* (ECMR 2018), 692-696.

Tax, S. S., McCutcheon, & Wilkinson, I. F. (2013). The service delivery network (SDN): A customer-centric perspective of the customer journey,‖*Internationa Journal of Service Research,,* 16, 454-470.

Teshita, U. C. & Gemedi, T. H. (2021). Assessment of customers' relationship management practices on customer retention and loyalty of oromia credit and savings share company: Bule hora city branch. *Advances in Operations Research*, 2021(1), 1-9.

Venkateswaran, P. S. & Sundram, S. (2021). Impact of retail service quality and store service quality on patronage intention towards organized retail industry. *Turkish Journal of Computer and Mathematics Education*, 12(3), 1462-1471.

Wirtz, J. & Lovelock, C., (2016). *Services marketing: People, technology, strategy* (8th ed.). World Scientific Publishing Co. Inc.

Zamil. A. A. (2011). Customer relationship management: A strategy to sustain the organisation's names and products in the customer's mind. *European Journal of Social Sciences,* 22(3), 451-459.

EFFECT OF UNEMPLOYMENT ON OUTPUT GROWTH IN NIGERIA: EVIDENCE FROM OKUN'S LAW

ABDULKAREEM, Abdulhafis Olagungu

Department of Economics
Kwara State University, Malete
a.oabdulkareem@yahoo.com
08034614045

Abstract

The study investigated the effects of unemployment on economic growth and the agricultural, industrial and services sectoral output growth. To achieve this, economy-wide output growth and sectoral output growth models were specified, using the neoclassical theory-based economy-wide and sectoral growth accounting equations as the main theoretical framework. In addition to the unemployment rate, 5 control variables (viz: labour force growth, private capital stock growth, foreign direct investment, government expenditure and literacy rate) were also included in all equations while the 3 sectoral output growth variables for the agricultural, industrial and services sector were the dependent variables. The OLS estimation method was employed, appropriate diagnostic tests were carried out, and remedial econometric measures were adopted to ensure the validity of the model estimates. Annual data covering the period of 1999 to 2022, sourced from the CBN, the World Bank and the IMF databases were employed in the analysis. It was found from the study that unemployment has a negative effect on economic growth as well as output growth in each of three sectors (viz: agricultural, industrial and services). Based on this finding, it is recommended that the authorities formulate and implement policies that will reduce the unemployment rate.

Keywords: Economic Growth, Unemployment and Sectoral Output

JEL Codes: O4, E24, O13, O14 and N7

1.   Introduction

Achieving economic growth is a top priority for governments in both developed and developing countries. This is because there is a strong connection between economic growth and overall social and economic development within a country. Additionally, research indicates that economic growth is influenced by numerous factors. However, for short-term macroeconomic analysis, it is important to consider inflation and unemployment rates as significant factors.

The unemployment rate particularly has been identified as a macroeconomic determinant of economic growth in what is referred to as Okun's Law. According to this, increasing unemployment simply implies that the resources for producing output have simply not

been engaged and thus remain idle and therefore output will continue to fall as unemployment increases. While several empirical studies have examined this issue (Cetin et al., 2015; Karikari-Apau & Abeti, 2019; Kukaj, 2018; Yolanda et al., 2020; and Rasheed, 2023), not many studies have been done in the Nigerian context. Particularly, it is desirable to know whether there are differences in the sectoral effect of unemployment. In order words, the predicted negative granted that it affects aggregate economic growth in the Nigerian setting (in respect of which there has hardly been any empirical evidence to this effect), it is of policy relevance to know if there are differences in sectoral effects of it. Hence, this study seeks to investigate not only the effect of unemployment on the economic-wide output growth in Nigeria but also verify the validity of Okun's law in the country and investigate whether and how such an effect pertains to the sectoral output growth in the form of growth of agricultural, industrial and services sectoral outputs.

The subsequent sections of the paper are structured as follows: the second section provides a comprehensive review of the pertinent literature, while the third section focuses on the methodology. The fourth section of the paper focuses on presenting and discussing the results obtained from data analysis. The fifth section, on the other hand, is dedicated to discussing the conclusion and recommendations of the paper.

2.0   Literature Review

2.1   Theoretical Review

The theoretical review of this study encompasses two main theories: Okun's Law and economic growth theories. These theories serve as a foundation for understanding the relationship between unemployment and economic growth, providing insights into the mechanisms and dynamics at play in the economy.

Put forward by Okun (1962), Okun's Law sheds light on the crucial connection between unemployment rates and an economy's production capacity. It essentially proposes an inverse relationship between the two: lower unemployment signifies a stronger labour market, often accompanied by rising economic output GDP, reflecting a more active and productive economy. Conversely, higher unemployment indicates a slowdown in growth and a decrease in GDP. There are two interpretations of this law, one posits that higher output growth leads to a decrease in unemployment. They explain that output growth that is higher than usual is associated with a reduction in the unemployment rate while output growth that is lower than usual is associated with an increase in the unemployment rate, and this is why unemployment goes up in recessions and down in expansions (Blanchard & Johnson, 2013). This interpretation implies that on average, an increase (decrease) in the economic growth rate explains decreases (increase) in the unemployment rate. The second interpretation, explains that the largest cost of unemployment is lost in production. People who cannot work do not produce, so high unemployment will result in a very high fall in output (Dornbusch et al., 2010). This version sees changes in the unemployment rate as explaining the decrease or increase in the economic growth rate. This paper goes with the second interpretation because the interest is to examine the effect of unemployment on economic growth.

Concerning economic growth theories, numerous such theories can be found in the academic literature. Significant ones among them include the classical theory, Schumpeter theory, neo-classical theory, and the endogenous growth theory. These theories will be reviewed sequentially in the paragraphs below.

Adam Smith (1776) posited in his exposition, a pivotal work in classical growth theory, that the division of labour among workers into specific tasks is the primary catalyst for growth. Furthermore, he highlighted that the availability of specific tools and equipment enables workers to enhance their efficiency. To achieve this, continuous capital accumulation is crucial, contingent upon capital owners being able to retain and reinvest profits. Smith illustrated this concept with the metaphor of the "invisible hand" of profits, which motivates entrepreneurs to engage in investment, productivity enhancements, and reinvestment for their gain, ultimately benefiting the entire economy indirectly.

In the Schumpeter (1911) theory, as elucidated by Adusei (2012), a well-established financial system accelerates technological innovation and economic growth by offering financial services and resources to entrepreneurs likely to effectively implement innovative products and processes. The theory underscores the significant role of credit in the economy, asserting that funds for investment do not stem from current income savings but rather from credit creation by the banking sector. Schumpeter further posited that entrepreneurs expand their ventures primarily through bank loans, not based on savings deposited in banks. Banks themselves generate credit to accommodate business borrowers, potentially leading to price inflation. Consequently, credit creation assists investors by freeing them from the savings routine, making forced savings a crucial mechanism for capital accumulation.

The theory of Neoclassical growth, as explained by Banton (2023), implies that output growth is dependent on growth in capital, labour, and technological input. A rise in the savings rate only boosts the steady-state levels of output per capita and per capita capital stock over time, without affecting the output growth rate. This is attributed to the diminishing marginal product of capital, where further capital increases lead to output declines. The theory also predicts that population growth diminishes capita and output per head levels, increasing the output growth rate.

Liberto (2023) described that the endogenous growth model as positing that economic growth emanates internally within the economy, specifically through endogenous mechanisms rather than exogenous ones. This standpoint stands in contrast to the neo-classical growth theory, which asserts that external factors like technological advancements, capital, and labour serve as the primary drivers of economic expansion. The endogenous growth theory postulates that population growth, human capital accumulation, and knowledge acquisition are the fundamental determinants of economic progress. Within a knowledge-centric economy, underpinned by strong intellectual property rights, the concept of diminishing returns to capital accumulation is eradicated due to the positive spill over effects stemming from investments in technology and human capital. Notably, productivity enhancement is contingent upon disparities in expenditures directed towards research and development as well as education in endogenous models, consequently leading to accelerated technological advancements. Nonetheless, it is contended that validating endogenous growth models through empirical

evidence remains a formidable challenge due to the presence of assumptions that defy precise measurement.

2.2   Empirical Review

A thorough review of the literature on the effects of change in unemployment on output growth reveals a variety of empirical studies that have investigated this subject across different countries and contexts. The empirical review is classified into two, studies that cover Africa and those that cover non-African countries.

In regards to non-African countries, several such studies have reported the expected negative effects of changes in unemployment on economic growth while others reported a nil effect. These studies include Shahid (2014) who investigated the effect of unemployment on economic growth in Pakistan, using ARDL to analyse time series data from 1980 to 2010 and found a long-run negative effect of unemployment on economic growth. Cetin et al. (2015) examined the impact of unemployment on economic growth in 15 EU countries from 1984 to 2012 using panel OLS and also found a negative effect of it. Dritsakis and Stamatiou (2016) investigated the relationship between the unemployment rate, economic growth, and inflation rate in Greece using a dynamic unrestricted error correction model and data from 1995 to 2015, it revealed that unemployment has a negative effect on economic growth in both the short and long run. Mohseni and Jouzaryan (2016) examined the role of inflation and unemployment on economic growth in Iran from 1996 to 2012, the ARDL result revealed a long-run negative effect of unemployment on economic growth. Kukaj (2018) using the Fixed Effect model investigated the relationship between unemployment and GDP growth in seven Western Balkan countries between 2001 and 2015 and found that unemployment negatively affects economic growth. Yolanda et al. (2020) analysed the effect of investment and unemployment on economic growth and poverty in North Sumatra Province of Indonesia, using pooled data from 2014 to 2018, and found a negative effect of unemployment on economic growth. Shah et al. (2022) assessed the impact of unemployment on the growth rate in Pakistan from 1974 to 2020, the ARDL result showed that unemployment rates negatively affect economic growth. Finally, Amalia and Miranti (2023) examined the effect of high unemployment rates on economic growth in Bali Province, Indonesia from 2017 to 2021 using the Random Effect model, and concluded that high unemployment rates negatively affect economic growth in Bali. On the other hand, Altamimi (2019) analysed the effect of the unemployment rate on the growth rate of the GDP of Jordan for the period 2009-2016 by employing the OLS technique, the result showed that unemployment has nil effect on economic growth in Jordan. Also, Sinha (2022) examined the impact of unemployment, inflation, capital stock, and human capital investment on India's economic growth from 1990 to 2021, the ARDL results showed that unemployment does not significantly impact real GDP in India in the long run.

Concerning the second strand of studies which covers African countries, the majority of the studies have similarly reported negative effects of unemployment on economic growth while just a few reported nil effect. These include Jibir et al. (2015) who examined the impact of unemployment on economic growth in Nigeria from 1982 to 2014 using the OLS technique and found a negative effect of unemployment on

economic growth. Similarly, Abula and Mordecai (2016) investigated the impact of unemployment on economic growth in Nigeria between 1981 and 2015 using OLS and VECM, but the result revealed no effect of unemployment on economic growth. In South Africa, Makaringe and Khobai (2018) investigated the trends and effects of unemployment on economic growth, using quarterly data from 1994Q1 to 2016Q4, the ARDL result revealed a long-term negative effect of unemployment on economic growth. Also, Elorhor (2019) analysed the effect of unemployment on economic growth in Nigeria from 1986 to 2008 by employing the OLS method and found a negative effect of unemployment on economic growth. Covering a wider range of countries, Eshun (2020) tested Okun's Law in 10 West African countries by adopting the Fixed Effect method to analyse data collected from 2004 to 2017 and confirmed the negative effect of unemployment on economic growth in West Africa. In South Africa, using a different approach and more data range than Makaringe and Khobai (2018), Sere and Tchereni (2020) studied the non-linear relationship between economic growth and unemployment from 1994Q1 to 2019Q4 using the ARDL model for estimation. The result showed that unemployment has nil effect on economic growth in South Africa. In a more recent study on Nigeria, Rasheed (2023) employed the ARDL model to test Okun's Law by investigating the effect of unemployment on economic growth from 2010 to 2020. The result supported the prediction of Okun's Law by revealing a negative effect of unemployment rates on economic growth, corroborating the earlier findings by Jibir et al. (2015); and Elorhor (2019). Sekwati and Dagume (2023) analysed the effect of unemployment and inflation on economic growth in South Africa from 1994 to 2018 and also confirmed its negative effect. Lastly, Nambie et al. (2023) empirically analysed the contribution of income inequality, financial inclusion, investment, and unemployment on economic growth in 42 Africa from 2001 to 2022. The Two-step system generalised method of moments (GMM) was used for estimation and the paper found that income inequality and unemployment have negative effects on economic growth.

It can thus be observed from the empirical studies reviewed in the above paragraphs that there is no consensus as regards the effect of unemployment on economic growth. Also, most of the studies analysed the effect of unemployment on economy-wide output growth while ignoring the effect of unemployment on sectoral output growth. However, knowing the sectoral effect will give policymakers an understanding of how unemployment affects the key sectors of the economy. Thus, the motivation of this study is to fill this gap in the literature.

3. Methodology

3.1 Theoretical Framework

Concerning the effect of unemployment on economic growth, the theoretical foundation is premised on Okun's Law. The choice of Okun's law is because it provides a quantitative framework for analysing the relationship between unemployment and economic growth. The law states that an increase in the unemployment rate will cause a reduction in economic growth. Unemployment represents underutilised labour resources; therefore, when fewer people work, it results in lower overall production and economic output. In its simplified form, this can be expressed as:

$$\left(\frac{\Delta Y}{Y}\right)_t = \alpha - \beta \Delta u_t \text{ ----------------------------------- (1)}$$

where $\left(\frac{\Delta Y}{Y}\right)_t$ is the GDP growth rate, Δu_t is the first difference or change in the unemployment rate, $\alpha \text{ and } \beta$ are the constant and intercept respectively and the subscript *t* is the period.

Concerning the growth theory, Dornbusch et al. (2010) provided the derivation of the growth accounting equation which is rooted in the neo-classical production function, as described below, starting with a neoclassical production function:

Assume an aggregate production function:

$$Y = Af(K, L)\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\text{(2)}$$

where A = indicator of the level of technology, K = capital stock, L = labour, and Y = output,

This production function implies that output is a function of labour, capital and technology.

Taking a total derivative of Y in the above Equation (2) gives Equation (3) below:

$$\Delta Y = MPL.\Delta L + MPK.\Delta K + F(K,N).\Delta A\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\text{ (3)}$$

where MPL and MPK stand for marginal productivities (or partial derivatives of Y concerning each) of labour and capital respectively. If Equation (3) above is divided by Equation (2), then the following will be arrived at:

$$\frac{\Delta Y}{Y} = \frac{MPL}{Y}.\Delta L + \frac{MPK}{Y}.\Delta K + \frac{\Delta A}{A}\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\text{ (4).}$$

Multiplying and dividing the first and second part of the Right-Hand Side (RHS) by L and K respectively will give:

$$\frac{\Delta Y}{Y} = \left(\frac{MPL}{Y}L\right)\frac{\Delta L}{L} + \left(\frac{MPK}{Y}K\right)\frac{\Delta K}{K} + \frac{\Delta A}{A}\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\text{ (5)}$$

Assuming a perfectly competitive market, so that factors are paid their respective marginal products, then, MPL = w and MPK = r, where w and r are the market wage rate and net capital rental rate. It should be noted that $\frac{MPL}{Y} * L$ and $\frac{MPK}{Y} * K$ represent the shares of labour and capital in the total income (Y) respectively. Replacing the labour and capital shares with $1 - \alpha$ and α respectively will give us the growth accounting equation below:

$$\frac{\Delta Y}{Y} = (1 - \alpha)\frac{\Delta L}{L} + \alpha\frac{\Delta K}{K} + \frac{\Delta A}{A}\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\ldots\text{ (6)}$$

Equation (6) shows that the sum of weighted growth rates of inputs (with the weight being a share of total output accruing to each factor of production) and the productivity growth rate on the right-hand side gives the growth of output on the left-hand side.

3.2 Model Specification

To determine the effect of unemployment on economic growth, the neo-classical growth equation adopted in this study is extended through the level of technology (A), which can be construed broadly as embodying productivity and efficiency in all ramifications. This extension is through the identification of possible determinants of productivity growth $(\frac{\Delta A}{A})$ and specification of the total factor productivity growth $(\frac{\Delta A}{A})$ function.

Unemployment and Other Factors Affecting Productivity Growth, $\frac{\Delta A}{A}$

The factor productivity growth, $\frac{\Delta A}{A}$, constitutes a growth of all factors, except growth in the explicitly identified factors of production [which are only labour and capital in the above Equation (6)], that influence economic growth. In the discussion here, such factors include unemployment, which is the main postulated determinant that is of primary interest. Added to this are the control variables, which are the labour force growth, private capital stock growth, foreign direct investment, government expenditure and literacy rate.

Economic theory predicts a negative effect of change in unemployment on economic growth (Blanchard & Johnson, 2013). This negative effect association stems from several key factors. Firstly, high unemployment rates signify a significant portion of the available workforce remaining unutilised, leading to a decline in the overall production capacity of the economy. When there are fewer workers producing goods and services, the total output of the economy, which is measured by Gross Domestic Product (GDP), decreases. As a result, unemployed individuals have less money to spend, leading to lower consumer spending and reduced overall demand. This prompts businesses to decrease production, potentially creating a harmful cycle that slows down economic growth (Blanchard & Johnson, 2013; Sidrauski, 1967). Lastly, prolonged unemployment can lead to a decline in the skills and knowledge base of the workforce, making it harder for them to re-enter the workforce and contribute to future economic growth (Mincer, 1991). Additionally, high unemployment rates are often accompanied by social problems like poverty, crime, and social unrest, which can place a significant strain on the economy, diverting resources away from productive activities and hindering growth potential (Layard et al., 1994). Therefore, on *a priori* grounds, this study also expects a negative effect of change in unemployment on economic growth.

Concerning the control variables, a higher literacy rate is generally expected to have a positive effect on economic growth. An educated workforce fosters increased productivity and innovation, as highlighted by Lucas (1988). This skilled labour force is better equipped to make informed decisions and adapt to technological advancements (Psacharopoulos, 1997). While a temporary mismatch between skills and available jobs might occur in rare cases (Autor, 2015), the overall impact of a literate population leans towards positive economic growth. Similarly, FDI is expected to have a positive effect on economic growth, since inflow typically creates jobs, reducing unemployment and increasing household incomes, which in turn stimulates further economic activity and growth. Foreign investors might also invest in critical infrastructure projects such as

roads, ports, and telecommunications, enhancing the overall efficiency of the economy and making it more attractive for further investment. Regarding government spending, this can positively influence economic growth when directed toward infrastructure development, such as roads, bridges, and utilities, which enhance productivity. Expenditure on human capital development, including education and healthcare, improves workforce quality and productivity, driving long-term growth. Additionally, spending on public goods and services, like law and order, creates a stable environment for economic activities, boosting investor confidence. During economic downturns, increased government spending acts as a counter-cyclical measure, stimulating demand and supporting economic recovery. On the other hand, if the government expenditure is not channelled to infrastructural development, human capacity building or institutional improvements, especially, if it is ridden with corruption and carried out where low quality of political governance prevails, this may have an adverse effect on productivity and also retard economic growth. For this study, it is posited that a positive effect of government expenditure on economic growth exists.

Mathematical Format of the Productivity Growth $(\frac{\Delta A}{A})$ Relationship

Following the above, a linear time series data-based deterministic equation for the total factor productivity growth is as specified below:

$$\left(\frac{\Delta A}{A}\right)_t = \beta_3\,\Delta u_t + \beta_4 FDI_t + \beta_5 LRT_t + \beta_6 GEXP_t \text{ --- (7)}$$

where: Δu_t = change in unemployment; FDI = foreign direct investment; LTR = literacy rate; GEXP = government expenditure while t subscript stands for period. It is expected that $\beta_3 < 0$; $\beta_4\ to\ \beta_6 > 0$

To examine the effect of unemployment on growth, the growth accounting model in Equation (6) is re-specified. This is done by substituting the productivity growth $(\frac{\Delta A}{A})$ Equation (7) into the growth accounting Equation (6) and transforming the result into an econometric growth model by adding the intercept β_0 and the stochastic error term (U), thus:

$$\left(\frac{\Delta Y}{Y}\right)_t = \beta_0 + \beta_1\left(\frac{\Delta L}{L}\right)_t + \beta_2\left(\frac{\Delta K}{K}\right)_t + \beta_3\Delta u_t + \beta_4 FDI_t + \beta_5 LRT_t + \beta_6 GEXP_t + \cup_t \text{--- (8)}$$

where: $\beta_1, to\ \beta_9$ represent the parameters to be estimated, with $\beta_1 = 1 - \alpha$ and $\beta_1 = \alpha$ in the growth accounting Equation (6). The a priori expectation concerning the parameters $\beta_3, to\ \beta_9$ are as previously stated mathematically in connection with Equation (7) while the earlier growth accounting Equation (6) implies: $\beta_1,\ \beta_2 > 0$. Also, the $\frac{\Delta Y}{Y}, \frac{\Delta L}{L}$, and $\frac{\Delta K}{K}$ are as defined in connection with the growth accounting Equation (6) (where α and $1 - \alpha$ are now replaced by β_1 and β_2 for notational convenience) while acronyms for other explanatory variables are as defined in connection with the productivity growth Equation (7).

This paper follows the majority of studies in the literature like Eshun (2020); Sere and Tchereni (2020); Shah et al. (2022); and Amalia and Miranti (2023); who adopted the

unemployment rate instead of the first difference in unemployment. Thus, Equation (8) is respecified as:

$$\left(\frac{\Delta Y}{Y}\right)_t = \beta_0 + \beta_1\left(\frac{\Delta L}{L}\right)_t + \beta_2\left(\frac{\Delta K}{K}\right)_t + \beta_3 U_t + \beta_4 FDI_t + \beta_5 LRT_t + \beta_6 GEXP_t + \cup_t \text{ --- (8a)}$$

where U_t = Unemployment rate and other parameters are as earlier defined

But the prime interest in this study is not just to analyse the economy-wide output growth but, instead, to analyse the sectoral output growth and this would require "stepping down" the above Equation (8) for the overall economic growth to the level or context of sectoral output growth.

Accordingly, concerning such sectoral output growth equations that are specified for estimation, the study first starts with the sectoral output level, denoted by y, concerning each of the three sectors of agriculture, industry and services, bearing in mind that the economy-wide output level or GDP, denoted by Y, is simply an aggregation of these three categories of sectoral output, y. By deriving a growth accounting relationship for each category of y (which is not shown here for brevity) that corresponds to the economy-wide growth accounting Equation (6); and by specifying a productivity growth relationship for the sectoral output (also, not shown here for brevity) in the same manner that is done to arrive at the economy-wide productivity growth Equation (7); and, finally, by using this sectoral productivity growth relationship to replace the productivity term in the sectoral growth accounting equation would yield the sectoral output growth Equation (9) below. It is to be noted that in this final sectoral output growth Equation (9), it is the economy-wide capital stock growth $(\frac{\Delta K}{K})$ and labour force growth $(\frac{\Delta L}{L})$ that still appear, instead of sector-specific capital stock growth and labour force growth. This is due to the absence of sector-specific statistics on capital stock and labour force and, hence, their growth rates. Concerning the unemployment rate as well as the other 3 control variables (viz: FDI, LTR and GEXP), it is these same economy-wide explanatory variables that apply to the economy-wide output growth $(\frac{\Delta Y}{Y})$ which are retained here as postulated determinants of each sectoral output growth $(\frac{\Delta y}{y})$. Sector-specific equivalents of them are inapplicable, unlike the sector-specific equivalents of economic-wide capital stock growth and labour force growth which are applicable but not employed due to the non-availability of sectoral statistics on them. Meanwhile, it is to be noted that it is the same directions of their effects on economy-wide output growth that are posited earlier that are still being retained here on sectoral output growth too.

$$\frac{\Delta y}{y}\frac{\Delta y}{y_t} = \beta_0 + \beta_1\left(\frac{\Delta L}{L}\right)_t + \beta_2\left(\frac{\Delta K}{K}\right)_t + \beta_3\Delta u_t + \beta_4 FDI_t + \beta_5 LTR_t + \beta_6 GEXP_t \quad \text{----} - (9)$$

The above sectoral output growth Equation (9) is estimated for each of the three sectors identified in this study, which are the growth of outputs of agricultural, industrial and services sectors, with these being denoted by $\frac{\Delta y_{agr}}{y_{agr}}$, $\frac{\Delta y_{ind}}{y_{ind}}$, and $\frac{\Delta y_{ser}}{y_{ser}}$ respectively.

3.3   Estimation Techniques

It is pertinent to stress that both descriptive and inferential analyses were carried out in this study. The descriptive analysis involves the use of summary statistics to describe each of the variables. Also, the study checked for the presence of a unit root concerning each variable, and the Ordinary Least Square (OLS) method of estimation was employed. Having conducted the post-estimation tests for serial correlation, heteroskedasticity, multicollinearity and normality test and having taken the appropriate remedial measure that the outcomes of the tests necessitate, the study then derives and presents the OLS estimates of the regression equations.

3.4   Data Sources and Measurement of Variables

The data used for this study is time series spanning between 1999 to 2022. The commencement date is chosen because that was the commencement of the current democratic era which is accompanied by the lifting of several economic sanctions imposed on Nigeria before this period as a result of the military rule, while the end date is chosen based on the availability of data. The definition of the variables employed, their sources and how they were measured are described below.

Concerning, real GDP growth, agricultural output growth or $\frac{\Delta y_{agr}}{y_{agr}}$, industrial output growth or $\frac{\Delta y_{ind}}{y_{ind}}$, and service growth or $\frac{\Delta y_{ser}}{y_{ser}}$, these were measured as the growth rate of their respective value-added and are sourced online from the online version of Central Bank of Nigeria's (CBN) Statistical Bulletin. Also, the unemployment rate or UNE is measured as a change in unemployment in the total labour force and it is sourced online from the World Bank's World Development Indicators (WDI)

FDI, according to the data source, is the net inflows of investment to acquire a lasting management interest (10 per cent or more of voting stock) in an enterprise operating in an economy other than that of the investor and it is measured as a percentage of GDP and it is sourced online from the World Bank's WDI. The literacy rate is measured as the adult literacy rate, the percentage of people ages 15 and above who can read and write with understanding a short simple statement about their everyday life. Capita stock growth or $\frac{\Delta K}{L}$ is measured as an annual percentage change in private capital stock that is sourced from the International Monetary Fund's Investment and Capital Stock dataset, IMF (2023). Lastly, labour force growth or $\frac{\Delta L}{L}$ is measured as an annual percentage change in the labour force (i.e., people aged 15 who are currently employed and those who are unemployed but seeking work as well as first-time job-seekers) and the data are sourced online from the World Bank's WDI.

4. Results and Discussion

4.1 Analysis of the Descriptive Statistics

Table 1 presents the summary statistics. The table consists of the columns for the variables and their description, mean, standard deviation (std. Dev.), minimum (min), and maximum (max) values.

Table 1: Descriptive Statistics

Variables and Description and Measure	Mean	Std. Dev.	Min	Max
$\frac{\Delta Y}{Y}$: GDP growth, annual % change in real GDP	4.263	2.682	0.1	10.6
$\frac{\Delta y_{agr}}{y_{agr}}$: Agricultural real output growth, %	6.6	10.6	1.9	55.6
$\frac{\Delta y_{ind}}{y_{ind}}$: Industrial real output growth, %	1.3	4.9	-8.9	12.2
$\frac{\Delta y_{ser}}{y_{ser}}$: Services real output growth, %	6.8	5.5	-2.2	20
$\frac{\Delta L}{L}$: Labor force growth, %	2.411	0.863	-1.615	2.760
$\frac{\Delta K}{K}$: Private capital stock growth, %	1.774	0.952	-1.505	3.223
U: Unemployment rate	4.117	0.623	3.507	5.633
LITR: Literacy rate, % of total population	58.457	4.78	51.08	70.20
GEXP: Government expenditure, % of GDP	16.074	5.025	9.754	30.857
FDI: Net foreign direct investment inflow, % of GDP	1.409	0.813	-0.040	2.900

Source: Author's computation (2024).

Explanatory Notes: Std Dev = standard deviation, Coeff of var = coefficient of variation, Min = minimum, max = maximum. The total number of observations for each variable is 24

Table 1 reveals the mean and standard deviation of agricultural output growth or $\frac{\Delta y_{agr}}{y_{agr}}$ to be 6.6% and 10.6%, with a minimum value of 1.9% and a maximum value of 55.6%. The mean and standard deviation of industrial output growth or $\frac{\Delta y_{ind}}{y_{ind}}$ were 1.3% and 4.9% respectively, with a minimum value of -8.9% and a maximum value of 12.2%, while the mean and standard deviation of service output growth or $\frac{\Delta y_{ser}}{y_{ser}}$ were 6.8% and 5.5%, with a minimum value of -2.2% and a maximum value of 20%. The mean and standard deviation of $\frac{\Delta Y}{Y}$ were 4.263 and 2.682 respectively (which shows that there is no wide variation from the mean), with a minimum value of 0.1 and a maximum value of 10.6. Also, the mean and standard deviation of U were 4.117 and 0.623 respectively (suggesting that U is not scattered away from the mean value), with a minimum value of

3.507 and a maximum value of 5.633. The mean and standard deviation of $\frac{\Delta L}{L}$ were 2.411 and 0.863 respectively (suggesting that there is no wide variation from the mean), with a minimum value of -1.615 and a maximum value of 2.760, while the mean and standard deviation of $\frac{\Delta K}{K}$ were 1.774 and 0.952 respectively (implying that $\frac{\Delta K}{K}$ does not vary widely from the mean value), with a minimum value of -1.505 and a maximum of 3.223.

As for FDI, it had a mean and a standard deviation of 1.409 and 0.813 respectively, with a minimum value of -0.040 and a maximum of 2.900. in the same vein, LTR had a mean and a standard deviation of 58.457 and 4.78 respectively, with a minimum value of 51.08 and a maximum value of 70.20. Finally, the mean and standard deviation of GEXP were 16.074 and 5.025 respectively, with a minimum value of 9.754 and a maximum of 30.857.

Table 2: Unit Root Test

Variables	z-statistic	p-value	Order of Integration	Conclusion
$\frac{\Delta Y}{Y}$	-2.126	0..234	I(1)	Unit Root
	-4.887	0.000	I(0)	
$\frac{\Delta y_{agr}}{y_{agr}}$	-3.598	0.006	I(0)	Stationary
	NA	NA	NA	
$\frac{\Delta y_{ind}}{y_{ind}}$	-3.403	0.011	I(0)	Stationary
	NA	NA	NA	
$\frac{\Delta y_{ind}}{y_{ind}}$	-1.771	0.395	I(1)	Unit Root
	-5.446	0.000	I(0)	
$\frac{\Delta K}{K}$	-2.813	0.057	I(1)	Unit Root
	-5.038	0.000	I(0)	
$\frac{\Delta L}{L}$	-2.126	0.234	I(0)	Unit Root
	-6.934	0.000	I(1)	
U	-3.698	0.004	I(0)	Stationary
	NA	NA	NA	
FDI	-1.683	0.440	I(1)	Unit Root
	-4.683	0.000	I(0)	
LTR	-3.702	0.004	I(0)	Stationary
	NA	NA	NA	
GEXP	-1.526	0.521	I(1)	Unit Root
	-3.365	0.012	I(0)	

Source: Author's computation (2024).

Table 2 shows that based on a 5% significance level, $\frac{\Delta y_{agr}}{y_{agr}}, \frac{\Delta y_{ind}}{y_{ind}}$, U and LTR are stationary levels, while $\frac{\Delta Y}{Y}, \frac{\Delta y_{ind}}{y_{ind}}, \frac{\Delta K}{K}, \frac{\Delta L}{L}$, FDI and GEXP are stationary after the first difference.

4.2   Results of Regression Analysis

The OLS estimates of the alternative specification of the earlier Equations (8a) and (9) are presented in Table 2 as the four models. Specifically, the first model is the economic growth equation that is equivalent to the previously specified Equation (8a). Similarly, the other three model estimates are the sectorial output growth of agricultural, industry and services sectors that are variants of the earlier Equation (9). Concerning all the model estimates, the coefficients, t-statistics, and p-values are reported in the first, second, and third columns respectively. The decision rule for this study is that a coefficient is taken to be significant if the p-value is less or equal to the 0.05 benchmark so that it is taken as insignificant if it is greater than 0.05.

Table 3a: OLS Estimates of the Regression Equations for Economic Growth ($\frac{\Delta Y}{Y}$) and Agricultural Sector Growth ($\frac{\Delta y_{agr}}{y_{agr}}$)

Variable	$\frac{\Delta Y}{Y}$			$\frac{\Delta y_{agr}}{y_{agr}}$		
	Coefficient	t-stat	p-value	Coefficient	t-stat	p-value
$\frac{\Delta K}{K}$	0.007	0.26	0.795	0.016	0.77	0.448
$\frac{\Delta L}{L}$	0.030	2.71	0.012	0.011	1.91	0.067
U	-0.129	-4.48	0.000	-0.030	-2.14	0.042
FDI	-0.003	-0.15	0.884	0.007	0.69	0.494
LTR	0.005	1.82	0.080	0.002	1.48	0.152
GEXP	0.007	1.71	0.100	0.002	0.61	0.545
Constant	0.1648	0.87	0.394	0.000	0.00	0.998
Observations	24	24				
R^2	0.372	0.110				
F Statistic	8.88	-	0.000	2.64	-	0.040
Breusch-Pagan test statistic for Heteroscedasticity	5.95	-	0.0147	20.98	-	0.000

Breusch -Godfrey test statistic for serial correlation	0.015	-	0.903	0.268	-	0.605
VIF statistic for Multicollinearity	1.59	1.59				
Jarque-Bera test statistic for normality	1.739	-	0.419	3.559	-	0.169

Source: Author's computation (2024).

Explanatory note: $\frac{\Delta Y}{Y}$ = GDP Output Growth $\frac{\Delta y_{agr}}{y_{agr}}$ = Agricultural Output Growth, U= change in Unemployment Rate, $\frac{\Delta K}{K}$ = Capital Stock Growth, $\frac{\Delta L}{L}$ = Labour Force Growth, FDI = Foreign Direct Investment, GEXP = Government Expenditure, LTR = Literacy Rate. A coefficient is deemed statistically significant if its p-value is less than or equal to the 0.05 significance level employed in the study

Table 3b: OLS Estimates of the Regression Equation for Economic Growth ($\frac{\Delta y_{ind}}{y_{ind}}$) and Agricultural Sector Growth ($\frac{\Delta y_{ser}}{y_{ser}}$),

Variable	$\frac{\Delta y_{ind}}{y_{ind}}$			$\frac{\Delta y_{ser}}{y_{ser}}$		
	Coefficient	t-stat	p-value	Coefficient	t-stat	p-value
$\frac{\Delta K}{K}$	-0.009	-1.01	0.323	0.000	0.00	0.999
$\frac{\Delta L}{L}$	0.018	3.10	0.005	0.001	0.10	0.922
U	-0.036	-2.42	0.023	-0.063	-3.27	0.003
FDI	-0.021	-1.78	0.088	0.010	0.93	0.361
LTR	-0.000	-0.33	0.742	0.004	2.12	0.044
GEXP	0.005	2.27	0.032	0.000	0.19	0.855
Constant	0.109	0.97	0.343	0.056	0.42	0.675
Observations	24	24				
R^2	0.348	0.499				
F Statistic	6.02	-	0.001	4.15	-	0.005
Breusch-Pagan test statistic for Heteroscedasticity	0.70	-	0.401	2.88	-	0.090
Breusch -Godfrey test statistic for serial correlation	0.329	-	0.566	0.176	-	0.675
VIF statistic for Multicollinearity	1.59	1.59				
Jarque-Bera test statistic for normality	0.268	-	0.875	0.815	-	0.960

Source: Author's computation (2024).

Explanatory note: $\frac{\Delta y_{ind}}{y_{ind}}$= Industrial Output Growth, $\frac{\Delta y_{ser}}{y_{ser}}$ = Service Output Growth, U= change in Unemployment Rate, $\frac{\Delta K}{K}$ = Capital Stock Growth, $\frac{\Delta L}{L}$ = Labour Force Growth, FDI = Foreign Direct Investment, GEXP = Government Expenditure, LTR = Literacy Rate. A coefficient is deemed statistically significant if its p-value is less than or equal to the 0.05 significance level employed in the study.

The R^2 for the four models (viz: economy-wide output growth, agricultural output growth, industrial output growth and services sector output growth) are 0.37, 0.11, 0.35 and 0.50 respectively while their corresponding F statistics are 8.88, 2.64, 6.02 and 4.15, with p-values that are below the benchmark of 0.05 significance level in all cases. This shows that the models are of good fit and have at least, modest explanatory powers.

Concerning the four models, the *VIF* statistics obtained on average is 1.59, which is below the threshold value of 10, above which multicollinearity may pose a serious concern (Gujarati & Porter, 2009). In the same manner, the result of the Breusch-Pagan test shows that two models suffer from heteroscedasticity (viz: a model for $\frac{\Delta Y}{Y}$ and $\frac{\Delta y_{agr}}{y_{agr}}$) as the p-values of the Breusch-Pagan test statistic are less than the 0.05 benchmark and these are corrected for, by obtaining the result presented in the upper section of Table 2 with robust standard error. For the remaining two models (viz: the models for $\frac{\Delta y_{ind}}{y_{ind}}$ and $\frac{\Delta y_{ser}}{y_{ser}}$), the estimates are free from heteroscedasticity as the p-values of the test statistics are above the 0.05 cut-off. Also, the result of the Breusch-Godfrey test shows that none of the models suffers from autocorrelation as the p-values of the computed test statistics are between 0.903 and 0.675, which are all higher than the 5% cut-off. Finally, the Jarque-Bera test statistics show that the residuals are normally distributed as the p-values of the test statistics are between 0.960 and 0.169, which are all higher than the 5% cut-off.

Having evaluated the diagnostic test, the performance of the specific variables in the models is now discussed below.

The result shows that the coefficients of *U* are negative and statistically significant in all four models estimated, which provides reliable evidence of the negative effects of *U* on $\frac{\Delta y_{agr}}{y_{agr}}$, $\frac{\Delta y_{ind}}{y_{ind}}$, $\frac{\Delta y_{ser}}{y_{ser}}$ and $\frac{\Delta Y}{Y}$. Concerning the performances of the control variables, the coefficients of $\frac{\Delta L}{L}$ are positive and statistically significant in two models (viz: models for $\frac{\Delta y_{ind}}{y_{ind}}$ and $\frac{\Delta Y}{Y}$), so $\frac{\Delta L}{L}$ has positive effects on $\frac{\Delta y_{ind}}{y_{ind}}$ and $\frac{\Delta Y}{Y}$. The coefficients of $\frac{\Delta L}{L}$ in the models for $\frac{\Delta y_{agr}}{y_{agr}}$ and $\frac{\Delta y_{ser}}{y_{ser}}$ as well as the coefficients of $\frac{\Delta K}{L}$ in all the models are not statistically significant. The coefficients of LTR and GEXP are positive and statistically significant only in the case of the model for $\frac{\Delta y_{ser}}{y_{ser}}$ and $\frac{\Delta y_{ind}}{y_{ind}}$, so both LTR and GEXP have positive effects on $\frac{\Delta y_{ser}}{y_{ser}}$ and $\frac{\Delta y_{ind}}{y_{ind}}$.

5.   Discussion of findings

The results obtained concerning the effect of unemployment on economy-wide output growth, agricultural output growth, industrial output growth and serves output growth indicate that unemployment has a positive effect on economy-wide output growth and each of the sectoral output growth. This finding is in line with the *a priori* expectation of this study and similar to empirical studies like Yolanda et al. (2020); Shah et al. (2022); Conteh (2021); and Obiekezie (2022) where the negative effect of change in unemployment on economic growth had similarly been reported. However, this is in contrast with the results of studies like Onwachukwu (2014); Seth et al. (2018); and Khan (2020) who have reported nil effect of unemployment on economic growth. It can be noted from the table that the magnitude of the coefficient of unemployment is higher in the services sector output growth model, followed by the industrial sector growth model and agricultural sector model and lastly in the agricultural output growth model so that the reducing effect of a percentage point increase in unemployment takes its greatest toll on services sectoral output growth, followed by industrial output growth, with least adverse effect on agricultural output growth.

Concerning the performances of the control variables, the result shows that labour growth has a positive effect on economy-wide output growth and industrial output growth. These observed positive effects are in line with the prediction of the earlier growth accounting Equation (6) that forms the basis of the theoretical framework adopted in the paper. It is also supported by the empirical studies of Khan et al. (2023) and Young (2018), among others, who similarly reported positive effects of labour force growth on economic growth. It is not surprising that the growth of the labour force does not have the expected effect on the growth of agricultural and services output, and that the capital stock does not have an effect on output growth in each sector. This is because these variables are for the overall economy and are not specific to individual sectors for which statistics are not available, as mentioned earlier in Section 3 of the paper.

Also, literacy rate and government expenditure have a positive effect on industrial output growth and services output growth These are also in line with the expectations of the study. At the empirical level, Abdulai and Abubakari (2022); Akanyonge et al. (2022); and Nguyen (2022) reported positive effects of government expenditure on economic growth, while Yeoh and Chu (2012); Bah (2023); and Khan et al. (2023) reported positive effects of literacy rate on economic growth

5.   Conclusion and Recommendations

The study investigated the effects of unemployment on economic growth and the agricultural, industrial and services sectoral output growth. To achieve this, economy-wide output growth and sectoral output growth models were specified, based on both the economy-wide and sectoral output growth accounting equations as the main theoretical framework. In addition to changes in the unemployment rate, five control variables (viz: labour force growth, private capital stock growth, literacy rate, foreign direct investment, and government expenditure) were also included as explanatory variables in the economy-wide model as well as each sectoral output growth model, while the dependent variables employed were economic growth and the three sectoral output growth variables

for the agricultural, industrial and services sector. The OLS method was employed to derive the estimates after post-estimation tests were conducted to test for serial correlation, heteroskedasticity, multicollinearity and normality of distribution of residuals and appropriate remedial econometric measures to ensure the validity of the reported estimates had been adopted. Data used are annual data covering the period of 1999 to 2022 and they were sourced online from the CBN's Statistical Bulletin, the World Bank's WDI database and the International Monetary Fund's Investment and Capital Stock dataset.

The study found that change in unemployment has a negative effect on economic-wide growth, agricultural output growth, industrial output growth and services output growth. The negative effects of change in unemployment on both the economic-wide growth and the sectorial output growth confirm the postulation of Okun's Law which predicts a negative effect of changes in unemployment on economic output growth. The result also shows that the output growth of the services sector is affected most by unemployment, followed by the industrial sector and lastly by the agricultural sector. Concerning the control variables, it was found that labour growth has positive effects on economic growth and industrial output growth. Literacy rate too has a positive effect on services output growth, while government expenditure was found to have a positive effect on industrial output growth.

In line with the findings above, it is recommended that authorities formulate and implement policies to reduce unemployment rates, thus increasing economic output growth and achieving more sustainable economic growth. Particularly, uneven focus should be placed on the need to reduce unemployment if policymakers are desirous of increasing output growth of the services sector since it is this sectoral output growth that has the highest degree of responsiveness to a unit change in unemployment rate among the three sectors analysed.

References

Abdulai, A. M., & Abubakari, A. (2022). Impact of government investment expenditure on economic growth in Ghana. *UDS International Journal of Development*, *9*(1), 698-709.

Abula, M., & Mordecai, B. D. (2016). An Econometrics Investigation into the Impact of Unemployment on Economic Growth in Nigeria (1981-2015). *EPH-International Journal of Science and Engineering*, *2*(2), 40-48.

Adusei, M. (2012). Determinants of bank board structure in Ghana. *The International Journal of Business and Finance Research*, *6*(1), 15-23.

Akanyonge, J., Atteh, C. A., & Asapeo, A. (2022). Government Expenditure on Economic Growth: Empirical Evidence from Ghana. *Texila International Journal of Academic Research*, *9*(1), 77-93.

AL-Tamimi, K. A. M. (2019). Effect of Unemployment Rate on Growth Rate of Gross Domestic Product of Jordan. *Research in World Economy*, *10*(3), 217-225.

Amalia, L. F., & Miranti, P. G. S. (2023). Analysis of The Effect Tourism Sector and Open Unemployment on Economic Growth in Bali Province. *Jurnal Statistika Universitas Muhammadiyah Semarang*, *11*(1), 34-44.

Autor, D. H. (2015). Why are there still so many jobs? The history and future of workplace automation. *Journal of economic perspectives*, *29*(3), 3-30.

Bah, I. A. (2023). The relationship between education and economic growth: A cross-country analysis. *Research, Society and Development*, *12*(5), e19312540522-e19312540522.

Blanchard, O., & Johnson, D. R. (2013). *Macroeconomics* (6th ed.). Pearson.

Cetin, M., Gunaydın, D., Cavlak, H., & Topcu, B. (2015). Unemployment and its impact on economic growth in the European Union: An evidence from panel data analysis. in *Regional economic integration and the global financial system* (pp. 12-22). IGI Global.

Conteh, K. (2021). Economic growth and unemployment: An empirical assessment of Okun's law in the case of Liberia. *Available at SSRN 3864474*.

Dornbusch, R., Fischer, S., & Startz, R. (2010). *Macroeconomics* (11th ed.). McGraw-Hill/Irwin.

Dritsakis, N., & Stamatiou, P. (2016). The Effects of Unemployment on Economic Growth in Greece. An ARDL Bound Test Approach. *Romanian Economic Journal*, *19*(62), 53-72.

Elorhor, O. T. (2019). Unemployment and its effect on the growth of Nigeria's economy. *Journal of Economics, Management and Trade*, *1*(9), 23-43.

Eshun, J. (2020). Economic Growth and Unemployment Issues in Ten (10) Selected West African Countries: A Panel Data Analysis. *Journal of Economics, Management and Trade*, *26*(5), 1-12.

Gujarati, D. N., & Porter, D. C. (2009). *Basic econometrics*. McGraw-hill.

Jibir, A., Bappayaya, B., & Babayo, H. (2015). Re-examination of the impact of unemployment on economic growth of Nigeria: An econometric approach. *Journal of Economics and Sustainable Development*, *6*(8), 116-123.

Karikari-Apau, E., & Abeti, W. (2019). The impact of unemployment on economic growth in China.

Khan, B. (2020). Unemployment and economic growth in Nigeria: A time-series analysis. *Journal of Economics, Finance and Accounting Studies*, *2*(1), 16-21.

Khan, M., Sarwar, K., & Niazi, G. R. (2023). The Impact of Education System on Economic Growth: An Empirical Evidence from Developing Economy. *Administrative and Management Sciences Journal*, *1*(2), 94-102.

Kukaj, D. (2018). Impact of unemployment on economic growth: Evidence from Western Balkans. *European Journal of Marketing and Economics*, *1*(1), 9-17.

Layard, R., Nickell, S., & Jackman, R. (1994). The unemployment crisis.

Lucas Jr, R. E. (1988). On the mechanics of economic development. *Journal of Monetary Economics*, *22*(1), 3-42.

Makaringe, S. C., & Khobai, H. (2018). The effect of unemployment on economic growth in South Africa (1994-2016).

Mincer, J. (1991). Human capital, technology, and the wage structure: what do time series show?

Mohseni, M., & Jouzaryan, F. (2016). Examining the effects of inflation and unemployment on economic growth in Iran (1996-2012). *Procedia Economics and Finance*, *36*, 381-389.

Nambie, N. B., Dadzie, P., & Haywood-Dadzie, D. O. (2023). Measuring the Effect of Income Inequality, Financial Inclusion, Investment, and Unemployment, on Economic Growth in Africa: A Moderating Role of Digital Financial Technology. *International Journal of Economics and Financial Issues*, *13*(4), 111-124.

Nguyen, H. T. (2022) Economic Growth and Government Expenditure in ASEAN Countries: A Threshold Approach.

Obiekezie, I. C. (2022). Impact of youth unemployment on economic growth in Nigeria. *Economic and Business Review*, *3*(3).

Okun, A. M. (1962). The predictive value of surveys of business intentions. *The American Economic Review*, *52*(2), 218-225.

Onwachukwu, C. I. (2014). Impact of monetary policy on inflation control in Nigeria.

Psacharopoulos, G. (1997). Child labour versus educational attainment Some evidence from Latin America. *Journal of Population Economics*, *10*, 377-386.

Rasheed, O. N. (2023). The Effect of Unemployment on Economic Growth in Nigeria. *American Journal of Applied Statistics and Economics*, *2*(1), 11-14.

Sekwati, D., & Dagume, M. A. (2023). Effect of unemployment and inflation on economic growth in South Africa. *International Journal of Economics and Financial Issues*, *13*(1), 35.

Sere, K. A., & Tchereni, B. (2020). Nonlinear modelling of economic growth and unemployment in South Africa. *Acta Universitatis Danubius. Œconomica*, *16*(6).

Seth, A., John, M. A., & Dalhatu, A. Y. (2018). The impact of unemployment on economic growth in Nigeria: An application of autoregressive distributed lag (ARDL) bound testing. *Sumerianz Journal of Business Management and Marketing*, *1*(2), 37-46.

Shah, S. Z. A., Shabbir, M. R., & Parveen, S. (2022). The impact of unemployment on economic growth in Pakistan: An empirical investigation. *iRASD Journal of Economics*, *4*(1), 78-87.

Shahid, M. (2014). Effect of inflation and unemployment on economic growth in Pakistan. *Journal of economics and sustainable development*, *5*(15), 103-106.

Sidrauski, M. (1967). Rational choice and patterns of growth in a monetary economy. *The American Economic Review*, 534-544.

Sinha, J. K. (2022). Impact of Unemployment and Inflation on the Economic Growth of India. *Journal of Development Economics & Finance*, *3*(2), 397-417.

Smith, A. (1776). An inquiry into the nature and causes of the wealth of nations: Volume One. London: printed for W. Strahan; and T. Cadell, 1776.

Yeoh, E. K. K., & Chu, K. M. (2012). Literacy, education and economic development in contemporary China. *Available at SSRN 2207559*.

Yolanda, C., Lubis, I., Ruslan, D., & Hardianti, A. (2020). Analysis of the Effects of Investment and Unemployment on Economic Growth and Poverty in North Sumatra Province. *International Journal of Research and Review (IJRR)*, *47*(8), 71-80.

Young, A. O. (2018). Impact of labour force dynamics on economic growth in Nigeria: An empirical analysis using ARDL Bound testing approach. *Journal of Resources Development and Management*, *42*(1), 31-46.